



**Minutes of a Stated Meeting of the  
Senate of New York University  
November 9, 2017**

A stated meeting of the Senate of New York University was held on Thursday, November 9, 2017, at 9 a.m., in the Colloquium Room of the Global Center for Academic and Spiritual Life, 238 Thompson Street. The meeting was convened with President Andrew Hamilton in the chair.

**Tenured/Tenure Track Faculty Senators Council (“T-FSC”) Members Present:** Nick Economides (Vice Chair), Sylvain Cappell, David Irving, Angela Kamer, Robert Lapiner, Michail Maniatakos, Jennifer Manuel (for Darcey Merritt), Allen Mincer, Niyati Parekh, Maurizio Porfiri, Dara Regaignon, Carol Reiss (for Jim Uleman), Ivan Selesnick (for Phyllis Frankl), Paul Smoke, Nancy Van Devanter, Alejandro Velasco (for Stephen Duncombe), Susan Waltzman, Amanda Watson, Sharon Weinberg, Brad Weslake, and Shamoan Zamir (by telephone).

**Full-Time Continuing Contract Faculty Senators Council (“C-FSC”) Members Present:** Mary Killilea (Chair), Martha Caprio, Aysan Celik, Lauren Davis, Michael Ferguson, Sam Howard-Spink, Scott Illingworth, Leila Jahangiri, Jung Kim, Tommy Lee (for Joseph Borowiec), Fidelindo Lim (for Larry Slater), Noelle Molé Liston, Joshua Paiz, Vincent Renzi, Ezra Sacks, Antonios Saravanos, and Ethan Youngerman.

**Student Senators Council (“SSC”) Members Present:** Juan Calero (Chair), Jacob Abbott, Nicole Acero, Mike Avgerinos, Ben Broderick, Tamara Cesaretti, Ghania Chaudhry, Husniye Cogur, Christine Dah-In Chung, Jaylan Daniels, Aishwarya Ajay Das, Selamawit Gashaw, Robert Geren (for Nicolas Duque-Franco), Annie Gurvis (for Frank Pettis), Christopher Hearn, Jamila Jahangir, Rachel Law, Tyla Leach, Itmum Momin, Shannon Morgan, Michelle Ng, Nhesthy Ong, Isaac Oseas, Max Pau, Sena Pottackal, Steven Ramdilal (by telephone), Pedro Tenreiro, and Asiya Vickers.

**Deans Council Members Present:** Dominic Brewer (Chair), Charles Bertolami, Thomas Carew, Fred Carl (for Allyson Green), Anastasia Crosswhite (for Peter Henry), Phillip Harper, Cheryl Heulton, Randy Hertz (for Trevor Morrison), Fiona Jaramillo (for Dennis Di Lorenzo), Gene Jarrett, Erin Potter (for Geeta Menon), David Schachter (for Sherry Glied), Michael Stoller (for Carol Mandel), Eileen Sullivan-Marx, and Susanne Wofford.

**Administrative Management Council (“AMC”) Members Present:** Michael McCaw (Chair), Katrina Denney, Regina Drew, Amy Fair, Carrie Meconis, Carolyn Ritter, and Pamela Stewart.

**University Administration Members Present:** Lisa Coleman, Martin Dorph, Katherine Fleming, Andrew Hamilton, and Terrance Nolan.

**Senate Committee Chairs (not mentioned above) Present:** Arthur Tannenbaum.

President Hamilton welcomed members of the Senate to the meeting.

### **Review and Approval of the Minutes of the October 5, 2017 Meeting**

Upon motion duly made and seconded, the Minutes of the October 5, 2017 meeting were approved unanimously as presented.

## **STANDING COMMITTEE REPORTS**

President Hamilton explained that the Senate Committee on Organization and Governance's 2016-2017 report on the function of the Senate recommended that, whenever possible, standing committees and constituent councils should provide written reports to be distributed with the materials in advance of the Senate meeting. He referred the Senate to the written reports that were provided in advance. He then called on those committee and council chairs who indicated they would like to provide a verbal report at the meeting.

### **Public Affairs Committee**

Arthur Tannenbaum, Public Affairs Committee Chair, reported that at its meeting on October 5<sup>th</sup>, the Committee reviewed its charges for the year and set dates for pursuing these items. He said that the Committee formed a Communications Task Force that has begun its work per the Senate Committee on Organization and Governance's recommendation in its 2016-2017 report on the function of the Senate.

Professor Tannenbaum asked the Senate to consider the resolution regarding the date of Commencement that was included with the Senate's materials. Upon motion duly made and seconded, the following resolution passed unanimously:

WHEREAS, the University Bylaws state that the Senate will determine the time, place, and manner of the University's Commencement Exercises; and

WHEREAS, the Rules of Procedure of the University Senate provide that the Senate Public Affairs Committee shall be concerned with matters relating to the timing and location of the Commencement exercises.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that upon the recommendation of the Public Affairs Committee, the 2018 All-University Commencement Exercises will take place on Wednesday, May 16, 2018 in Yankee Stadium. Accordingly, Grad Alley will take place on Tuesday, May 15, 2018.

### **Committee Reports**

President Hamilton invited questions from the Senate concerning the written reports that were distributed to the Senate in advance of the meeting.

## **COUNCIL REPORTS**

### **Administrative Management Council (AMC)**

AMC Chair Michael McCaw referred to his written report distributed to the Senate in advance of the meeting. He said he wanted to highlight the AMC Thanksgiving Food Drive and asked members of the Senate to consider participating by donating items online or at the drop-off locations across campus.

### **Tenured/Tenure Track Faculty Senators Council (T-FSC)**

T-FSC Vice Chair Nick Economides reported on behalf of T-FSC Chair Wen Ling. Professor Economides said that at its meeting on October 12<sup>th</sup>, Patricia Halley from the University's Human Resources department, along with Mark Petit and a consultant from Cammack Retirement Group, presented on steps to make TIAA the single record keeper for retirement funds for faculty and administrators, effective April 2018. He reported that after a lengthy discussion, the T-FSC passed a resolution to propose that the University Administration add faculty representation on the University Retirement Committee.

Professor Economides reported that he gave a presentation on the University's current and projected financial condition at the T-FSC meeting on November 2<sup>nd</sup>. Also at that meeting, the T-FSC Nominating Committee presented a list of candidates for T-FSC Chair for the 2018-2019 academic year. The T-FSC also unanimously approved the tenure and promotion guidelines for the Stern School of Business, which were reviewed by the Personnel Policies and Tenure Modifications Committee. Professor Economides said that T-FSC members participated in a lengthy discussion about faculty mobility across campuses and the implication to the University's academic programs. MJ Knoll-Finn, Vice President for Enrollment Management, also gave a presentation to the T-FSC on the University's student success initiative.

### **Student Senators Council (SSC)**

Juan Calero, SSC Chair, summarized the SSC written report that was distributed to the Senate in advance of the meeting. He said that Student Government passed resolutions or released statements on the following matters: 1) requesting that the University review the agreement designating the name of the Elmer Holmes Bobst Library and consider asking the Bobst Foundation to agree to change the name of the library while retaining the legacy of the Bobst family; 2) proposing the addition of a SSC seat allocated to Liberal Studies, which has been referred by the Senate Executive Committee to the Senate Committee on Organization and Governance; 3) ratification of the body of the student government's Presidents Council, unifying all School Council Presidents across the University and all Constituency Councils as represented across departments within Student Affairs; 4) the horrible events of the Las Vegas massacre and offering condolences to those affected; and 5) the rejection of fascist, white supremacist, European imperialist, and anti-Semitic discourse at NYU.

Mr. Calero said that student government has been discussing providing aid to students

displaced by, or experiencing financial difficulties resulting from, the hurricanes in the Caribbean, as well as improving interactions with the Board of Trustees. He reported that Tandon School of Engineering students and representatives had successfully petitioned for the opening of a new 24-hour space in the Rogers Hall 2nd Floor Commuter Lounge and that student leadership across the University will be given Mental Health Crisis Trainings, a form of first aid training for mental health. Finally, Mr. Calero said that student government would like to make clear to the university bodies present at the Senate meeting that students are, have been, can, should, and must be a part of policy discussions where prudent and relevant, particularly if speaking to the contemporary lived experiences of students.

## **PRESENTATION AND DISCUSSION ON EDUCATIONAL TECHNOLOGY**

President Hamilton introduced Clay Shirky, Vice Provost for Educational Technologies who previously served as Chief Information Officer at NYU Shanghai. Mr. Shirky said that he would focus his presentation on three items: 1) background on online technology today; 2) how NYU is approaching educational technology; and 3) the student population for online degrees.

Mr. Shirky said that the development of technology around online learning has resulted in gradual changes in higher education institutions rather than the more sudden and dramatic change that some expected. He added that although some feared that private for-profit institutions would take over the online space, there has actually been a decline in distance enrollment over the past several years at private for-profit institutions.

Mr. Shirky next discussed how NYU is currently operating within this environment. He said that in academic year 2017 there were more than 14,000 at NYU across a diverse range of degrees, with no degree being awarded to more than 500 graduates and a number of degrees awarded to just one graduate. He added that the University currently offers around 20 online degrees and that another 15 or so will launch in the next 18 months. Most of the online degrees offered thus far are in the School of Professional Studies, Tandon School of Engineering, and Steinhardt School of Culture, Education, and Human Development, but the Stern School of Business, Wagner Graduate School of Public Service, and NYU Shanghai have also been developing courses and degree programs. Mr. Shirky said that there has not been a central strategy around online degrees and so the University is now looking to the individual schools who have been working in this arena to help develop the University's strategy.

Lastly, Mr. Shirky commented on the student population pursuing online degrees. He said that there is a large pool of individuals who wish to pursue a college degree but don't because of the inconvenience. Launching online degree programs, he said, is a way to reach a more diverse range of students.

Mr. Shirky then invited questions and comments from members of the Senate. In response to questions received, Mr. Shirky said that the average class size for online courses at NYU is small, and that faculty members teaching online courses are encouraged to think about

what kind of interaction is most beneficial rather than just replacing a live classroom with video. Mr. Shirky reported that the University is working on developing a template that can be used as a starting point for course development but can also be modified according to needs. In regard to compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA), Mr. Shirky said that the University is adopting ADA guidelines for its online course materials. In response to a question about the number of online degrees at the graduate level versus the undergraduate level, Mr. Shirky noted that at this time New York State has approved many more programs for associate's and master's degrees than for bachelor's degrees. On the matter of build versus buy, Mr. Shirky said that the University will engage with a provider when it makes sense but generally favors a cooperative model where vendors work on a piece of a larger program that the University is developing.

President Hamilton thanked Mr. Shirky for his presentation.

### **REPORT OF THE PRESIDENT**

President Hamilton updated the Senate on the progress of tax reform in Washington and the potential impact on higher education. He noted that to pay for a portion of the cuts to corporate and estate taxes, the current proposed tax bill removes deductions for state and local income taxes, removes the deduction for tuition loan interest payments, and includes a tax on income from university endowments if those endowments exceed a certain per student level (which does not impact NYU's endowment as currently written). He said that the proposal also targets a number of benefits. Changes to the tax structure could also impact charitable giving.

President Hamilton stressed that NYU is working closely with organizations like the Association of American Universities (AAU) and the American Council on Education (ACE) to make arguments against these tax proposals. He has made several trips to Washington, meeting with members of Congress on both sides of the aisle. President Hamilton encouraged members of the University Senate to contact their Senator or Congress member to express their view on the proposals.

President Hamilton next gave an update regarding the unfortunate circumstance where two NYU faculty members were denied visas to teach at NYU Abu Dhabi, which was referenced at the October Senate meeting. He said that some groups within the University have expressed deep concern and made strong statements about disengagement with NYU Abu Dhabi. President Hamilton said that while he respects the views that have been expressed, he disagrees about disengagement because that would only act to punish students and faculty. He added that NYU Abu Dhabi and the global network are remarkable contributions to the world of higher education that allow for the teaching of students and the pursuit of scholarship in many different parts of the world where individuals might not otherwise have these opportunities. President Hamilton said that he recognizes the value of having NYU establish a set of consistent procedures that could be applied across the global network in cases of visa complications, and so he has asked a group of faculty to give guidance and advice on developing this.

Lastly, President Hamilton announced a new NYU program that will provide tuition, housing in a student residence hall, a meal plan, and enrollment in NYU's student health insurance for the spring 2018 semester for up to 50 undergraduate students currently enrolled in colleges in Puerto Rico whose education is being disrupted by the recent hurricane. President Hamilton thanked the SSC for its strong advocacy in this area and encouraged members of the Senate to pass along information about the program to contacts in Puerto Rico.

President Hamilton then invited questions and comments from members of the Senate. President Hamilton provided additional information about the program to aid students in Puerto Rico in response to questions. He clarified that in order to ensure that it will not negatively affect schools in Puerto Rico, the program will be a temporary measure with an aim for the students to return to their home school. He said that NYU students in New York who are from Puerto Rico and who have been impacted can explore services offered on campus as needed.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 10:33 am.

Respectfully submitted,  
Jessica Graham  
Director, Office of the Secretary