



**Minutes of a Stated Meeting of the
Senate of New York University
December 5, 2013**

A stated meeting of the Senate of New York University was held on Thursday, December 5, 2013, at 2:00 p.m., in the Colloquium Room of the Global Center for Academic and Spiritual Life, 238 Thompson Street. The meeting was convened with Dr. Sexton in the chair.

Faculty Senators Council Members Present: Raghu Sundaram (Chair), Mark Alter, Everett Allgood, Awam Amkpa, Adam Becker, Ananda Dasanayake (for Nancy Van Devanter), Michael Dinwiddie, Todd Disotell, Halina Frydman (for Jennifer Carpenter), Magued Iskander (for Maurizio Porfiri), Jim Jacobs, Warren Jelinek, Mitchell Kane, Ann Morning, Allen Mincer, Arvind Rajagopal, Victor Rodwin, Eero Simoncelli, Celia Stewart (for Wen Ling), David Stokes, Mark Walters (for Sewin Chan), and David Zwanziger.

Student Senators Council Members Present: Mariam Ehrari (Chair), Corey Blay, Charvis Buckholts, Jean-Claude Cantave, Anushua Choudhury, Mason Dettloff, Griffin Dooling, Jessica L Hawk, Derek Hedbany, Michael Hengerer, Harris Inskeep-Rosenfeld, Sameer Jaywant, Kevin Jones, Daniel Kao, Ethan McCooper, Annie McWilliams, Brian Plaut, Danyal Syed, and Patrick Totaro.

Deans Council Members Present: Charles Bertolami, Mark Callahan (for Lynn Videka), Patricia Carey (for Mary Brabeck), Thomas Carew, Scott Fritzen (for Sharon Glied), Randy Hertz (for Trevor Morrison), Joanne Hvala (for Peter Blair Henry), Willie Long (for G. Gabrielle Starr), Ken Tabachnik (for Mary Schmidt Campbell), and Diann Witt (for Geeta Menon).

Administrative Management Council Members Present: David Vogelsang (Chair) John De Santis, Anita Dwyer, and Kristi Schwindt Ramos.

University Administration Members Present: Robert Berne, Bonnie Brier, Lynne Brown, Martin Dorph, Norman Dorsen, David McLaughlin, and Katepalli R. Sreenivasan.

Review and Approval of the Minutes of the November 7, 2013 Meeting

Upon motion duly made and seconded, the Minutes of the November 7, 2013 meeting were approved unanimously as presented.

COMMITTEE REPORTS

Academic Affairs Committee

Mr. Plaut reported that Committee met once since the Senate's last meeting and made recommendations to the Academic Affairs Committee of the Board of Trustees regarding honorary degree candidates, established a Subcommittee on the University Calendar for academic years 2015-16, 2016-17, and 2017-18, and discussed undergraduate student advising. He noted that the Committee will continue to discuss the latter two issues at future meetings and will submit its recommendations to the Senate regarding the academic calendar in the spring.

Committee on Organization & Governance

Dr. Jelinek thanked the Senate Councils for their responses to SCOG's request for comment regarding representation of the Full-Time Contract Faculty (FTCF) in the Senate. He advised that election of delegates to a Planning Committee on FTCF representation in the Senate was completed on November 8; and SCOG then transmitted a memo to the Planning Committee on November 14 asking the Planning Committee to provide SCOG with advice and counsel on FTCF representation in the University Senate, and offering to serve as an informational resource to the Planning Committee by providing information on the current composition of the Senate and models of representation of the current Councils in the Senate as possible models of representation for the FTCF to consider for its own Council. Dr. Jelinek reported that the Planning Committee held its first meeting on November 20, when it heard briefly from Dr. Sexton, elected Ann Marie Mauro, Clinical Associate Professor in the College of Nursing, and Randolph Mowry, Clinical Associate Professor in the Steinhardt School of Culture, Education, and Human Development, as co-chairs, and it plans to meet again on December 2.

He related that SCOG met on November 21, where it reviewed the comments from the Councils regarding the changes in the size and composition of the Senate that will occur when the FTCF gain representation, and agreed to meet as soon as possible with the Planning Committee to learn its opinions. Dr. Jelinek noted that as the Senate Executive Committee also expressed a desire to meet with the Planning Committee, and the three bodies are scheduled to meet jointly on December 9. He advised that SCOG will share the responses from the Senate Councils with the Planning Committee prior to that meeting.

From a substantive perspective, Dr. Jelinek reported that SCOG agreed that the proportionality of faculty (aggregate tenure/tenure track and FTCF) to student representation in the Senate should remain approximately the same as it is currently, so that any increase in total faculty representation would mean an increase in SSC representation, and that the AMC should get an additional seat if the Senate is enlarged. SCOG also agreed to suggest to the Senate Executive Committee that it

consider initiating a Senate self-evaluation to begin after a FTCF Council is seated in the Senate for the purpose of evaluating how the proportional representation of Councils in the Senate relates to the effectiveness of the Senate. Based on the results of a self-study, he advised that SCOG might recommend changes to the composition of the Senate to best assure that the relative and appropriate proportional representation of the different Councils aligns the functions of their respective constituencies with the functions of the Senate.

Public Affairs Committee

In Professor Tannenbaum's absence and at his request, Senior Vice President for University Relations and Public Affairs and Committee member Lynne Brown provided two moments in history: on this date in 1776, five students from the College of William and Mary meeting in a bar established Phi Beta Kappa; and on this date in 1933, Prohibition ended.

Dr. Brown reported on the Committee's discussions regarding workers' safety in Bangladesh in response to a letter from the Student Labor Action Movement (SLAM), and the Committee's unanimous recommendation that the Senate pass the resolution that was sent to all Senators and Alternates in advance of the meeting. In response to a question from a Senator about the January 1, 2013 effective date in the resolution, Dr. Brown responded that the resolution is meant to be retroactive.

Upon motion duly made and seconded, the following resolution was approved unanimously by the Senate:

WHEREAS, the world's attention has recently been focused on the dangerous conditions of garment factories in Bangladesh, as seen most tragically in the deadly fire and building collapse at Rana Plaza in April 2013; and

WHEREAS, colleges and universities, including NYU, enter into license agreements, to produce our logo and athletic apparel, much of which is manufactured overseas, including in Bangladesh; and

WHEREAS, this issue has been brought to our attention by the Student Labor and Action Movement (SLAM), a local NYU chapter of United Students Against Sweatshops; and

WHEREAS, a consortium of apparel manufacturers and trade unions have created the Accord on Fire and Building Safety in Bangladesh, which states that it is an independent, legally binding agreement designed to make all Bangladeshi garment factories safe workplaces; and

WHEREAS, the Accord establishes a program that includes: (1) independent factory safety inspections and public reporting of those

inspection results; (2) remediation of any identified safety issues and the availability of sufficient funds for remediation; (3) provisions for workers, including continuation of wages while factories may be closed for remediation, efforts to ensure that any workers whose employment is terminated as a result of any loss of orders at a factory are offered employment with safe suppliers, and respecting the right of a worker to refuse work that he or she believes is unsafe without suffering discrimination or loss of pay; (4) creation of an extensive fire and building safety training program; and (5) financial contributions from signatory companies, on a sliding scale, to fund the Accord's activities; and

WHEREAS, the Accord has already been signed by over 100 apparel corporations from 19 countries, international unions, and Bangladesh trade unions, thereby covering more than 1,600 garment factories; and

WHEREAS, NYU has been monitoring the situation via the Worker Rights Consortium, an independent labor rights monitoring organization, of which NYU is a founding member, which has advised its affiliate universities that they require that any licensees which use Bangladeshi factories sign the Accord; and

WHEREAS, two of the university's licensees (Adidas and Knights Apparel) have already signed on to the Accord; and

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, that, upon the recommendation of the Public Affairs Committee, the Senate recommends that the University Administration follow the guidance of the WRC and add to its existing labor rights requirements for licensees a requirement that licensees that sourced, produced or purchased collegiate apparel in Bangladesh as of January 1, 2013, or do so at any point thereafter, become signatories to the Accord on Fire and Building Safety in Bangladesh. The University Administration should work through the Collegiate Licensing Company to communicate any changes in its labor code of conduct to NYU's licensees promptly.

Dr. Sexton thanked the students from SLAM and advised we will proceed as expeditiously as possible to implement the recommendations.

Financial Affairs Committee

Mr. Dorph reported that the Committee met last Tuesday and heard from each of the Councils regarding preliminary ideas and areas of interest concerning the University budget process, and from Marilyn McMillan, Vice President for Information Technology and Chief IT Officer, and Tom Delaney, Vice President for Global Technology and Chief Global Technology Officer, about IT strategy and investments. He related that the next meeting in January will focus on the finances of the University's benefits program.

COUNCIL REPORTS

Administrative Management Council

Mr. Vogelsang reported that the AMC met on December 3 and discussed its report to the Senate Finance Committee, recommendations to SCOG regarding Senate composition, a letter writing campaign to Congress in support of the Commuter Parity Act, a University team award proposal presented by Human Resources, and a space usage proposal for the Torch Club next year. He related that the AMC officially welcomed colleagues from NYU-Poly to the meeting and will hold elections for NYU-Poly representation in the AMC before the Winter Break. Mr. Vogelsang noted that the AMC also heard from the NYU Combined Campaign, that the Community Service Committee donated 400 hats and scarves to the USO, and that the AMC launched its Ninth Annual Toy Drive for Children in the Ninth Precinct, information about which can be found on the AMC website.

Deans Council

In Dean Videka's absence, Deans Council Vice Chair Tom Carew advised that the Deans Council has not met since the last Senate meeting and will hold its next meeting on December 11.

Faculty Senators Council

Dr. Sundaram reported that at its last meeting, the FSC discussed representation of contract faculty and recommendations to SCOG regarding Senate composition, a proposed amendment to University Bylaw 63(c), and changes in the Faculty Handbook, and submitted detailed questions to the University Space Priorities Working Group to which detailed answers in response were received. He noted that the FSC's Finance Subcommittee will soon meet with Executive Vice President for Finance and Information Technology Martin Dorph to better understand the University's finances and budget process, and believes information and understanding regarding the University budget is critical to the FSC's participation in shared governance and in providing advice regarding the University budget process.

Student Senators Council

Ms. Ehrari reported since the last University Senate Meeting, the SSC submitted recommendations to Senate Executive Committee regarding the Senate's size and scope, emphasizing the core principles of equity, flexibility, and scalability. She related that the SSC partnered with the FSC, AMC, Deans Council, and senior administration to hold a vigil and benefit concert for those impacted by the typhoon that struck the Philippines. Ms. Ehrari noted that the SSC is pleased that an agreement has been reached regarding graduate student unionization, the SSC continues to discuss

requests from NYU Divest, and has planned its first 24-hour Build a Better NYU Hackathon open to students, faculty, administration and alumni.

Ms. Ehrari described the SSC's proposed amendment to the Senate Rules, as presented at the last meeting and attached to these minutes as Exhibit A, which would retain the current three-year limit on serving as a Student Senator-at-Large, but remove the prohibition on more than two-year's consecutive service as a Student Senator-at-Large.

Upon motion duly made and seconded, the amendment to the Senate Rules was approved unanimously by the Senate

ENGINEERING RETURNS TO NYU

Dr. Sexton introduced Katepalli R. Sreenivasan, President of NYU-Poly and Dean of Engineering, who reported on the University's merger with NYU-Poly, which will be effective January 1, 2014, at which point NYU-Poly will become NYU's Polytechnic School of Engineering. Dr. Sreenivasan described Poly's Brooklyn campus, which is comprised of 800,000 square feet of both owned and leased property, as well as a new building under construction on First Avenue in Manhattan that will house the College of Dentistry, the College of Nursing, and Bioengineering.

He provided information about Poly's student body of 2,100 undergraduate students, 2,800 graduate students, and 250 Ph.D. students, which will make up 13 percent of NYU's student body. He reported that for the class that entered in fall of 2013, the median SAT score was 1340, and it is comprised of 26 percent women, 52 percent Pell Grant eligible students, 18 percent disadvantaged minorities, and 40.5 percent who are the first in their family to attend college; in addition, the retention rate for the prior year's entering class was 88 percent. Dr. Sreenivasan noted that quantitative GRE scores for entering graduate students are comparable to other engineering schools and that Poly has awarded between 25 and 40 Ph.D. degrees annually since 2010.

He related that NYU-Poly has 94 tenured or tenure-track faculty, approximately 70 contract faculty, and approximately 200 adjunct faculty, and that research expenditures have increased from 13 percent to 15 percent of all research conducted at NYU. Dr. Sreenivasan described NYU-Poly's incubators, which are among the top ten in the country according to *Worth* magazine and housed in two locations, with a third being set up at Metrotech Center in Brooklyn. He noted the significant impact these incubators have on the local economy and the opportunities they create for graduates.

Dr. Sreenivasan described Poly's improving finances as due in large part to its affiliation with NYU in 2008 and the tuition generated by students eager to attend. He reported that NYU-Poly was ranked second in diversity among Non-Historically Black Colleges and Universities by *US News and World Report*, third in "Return on Investment" among all four-year institutions in the country by PayScale.com, ninth in graduate online programs by *US News and World Report*, and twelfth in Video Game Design by the

Princeton Review, and noted the successful completion of its recent Middle States accreditation.

He discussed that challenges ahead include improving Poly's graduate and institutional rankings and decreasing its dependence on tuition, which is currently 80 percent of its annual revenue. In response to a Senator's question, Dr. Sreenivasan noted that Poly's \$115 million endowment will become assets of and managed by NYU once the merger is completed, but that the endowment will be used for the benefit of Poly. Dr. Sexton added that Poly will be treated as a school for budget purposes, which will benefit all schools because of its contributions to common charges.

A Senator noted interest in technology and entrepreneurship at Poly among Stern students and Dr. Sreenivasan described Poly's entrepreneurship clubs and their availability to Stern students. He added that Stern could be helpful in facilitating the marketing of prototypes developed in Poly's incubators.

In response to a Senator's question about Poly's physical distance from the Washington Square campus, Dr. Sreenivasan said that the distance may be an impediment to integration, but that Poly students have been using the NYU gyms and the libraries, students already can take classes at both Poly and Washington Square, and that Poly is trying to change its class schedule to enable easier travel for students.

A Senator asked if Dr. Sreenivasan expects a shift in the proportion of graduate and Ph.D. students as Poly evolves and Dr. Sreenivasan stated that the number of Ph.D. students at Poly is in large part a reflection of research grants available at Poly, which he expects will increase.

REPORT OF THE PRESIDENT & PRESIDENT'S QUESTION TIME

Dr. Sexton referred to the memorandum that was circulated to each Senator, and is attached to these minutes as Exhibit B, outlining some of the individual and collective achievements at the University since the Senate's last meeting.

Middle States Accreditation Process

Dr. Sexton introduced Norman Dorsen, professor in the Law School and Counselor to the President, who reported on the Middle States Accreditation Process and Self-Study that has taken place over the past two and-a-half years. Mr. Dorsen stated that every college and university must be reaccredited every ten years and chooses an area for self-study; he advised that our self-study focuses on multi-school and interdisciplinary programs, including examining the potential for intellectual innovation and its impact on solving complex problems.

Mr. Dorsen described the four areas of multi-school study chosen as the focus of the self-study: public health, cities and their environments, arts and humanities, and data science (or "big data"), and the establishment of working groups for each of the areas,

as well as a fifth area called “Insights.” He also noted that questionnaires were developed for other areas, including genomics, media and gaming, and neuroscience to explore overlapping subjects. He related that the working groups met over a nine-month period and issued preliminary reports to the self-study steering committee, which will submit a final report to Middle States during the first week in February; and Middle States will then use the self-study report as part of its review in determining whether NYU continues to meet accreditation standards. Dr. Sexton added that a draft report was disseminated to the NYU community earlier this year and invited members of the Senate to submit their comments.

Mr. Dorsen described how the report will assist the University in assessing its accomplishments and areas where improvement is needed, and that after the results of the 2004 study of undergraduate education, a committee of undergraduate deans examined the recommendations from Middle States and substantially altered portions of the curriculum.

President’s Question Time

Dr. Sexton responded to the FSC’s question about compensation of top administrators, describing the Compensation Committee of the Board of Trustees’ rigorous approval process, which includes external benchmarking against top ranked research universities and obtaining guidance from a nationally-recognized compensation consultant, who reviews the reasonableness of the proposed compensation and provides guidance with respect to IRS protocols, compensation standards, and trends involving nonprofit organizations. He noted that while NYU faculty salaries for full and assistant professors currently are in the top ten nationally and associate professors are within the top 15, administrator salaries are between the 75th and 90th percentile, with some exceptions. Dr. Sexton spoke to the confidential nature of compensation packages and emphasized that he could speak only to his own base compensation, which was just reviewed by a compensation consultant and was found to be in the 75th to 90th percentile of 20 peer institutions. He noted that, unlike peer university presidents, he does not receive outside compensation or accept membership on corporate boards.

In response to the SSC’s question about plans to increase enrollment at the study-away site in Washington, DC, Dr. Sexton stated that each study-away site is developed to be self-supporting so as not to burden the University, that we expect all new sites, as “start-ups” to build up over time, and we expect the DC site to be very successful. He noted that we received substantial contributions for the DC site from local alumni there who felt that DC offered unique opportunities for students. He concluded by advising that planning is underway among school deans to establish additional pathways for students to participate at the site.

Dr. Sexton responded to the FSC’s question about individual schools’ attempts to become more transparent to their faculties, noting that while each school has a different culture, he believes that the deans are receptive to appropriate levels of transparency. He pointed to individual salary information as an example of disclosure that would not

be productive. He related that when he was Dean of the Law School, there was an annual, in-depth budget discussion that contributed to faculty understanding of the School's operations.

Dr. Sexton wished all attendees a happy holiday and wonderful new year.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 3:58 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,
Bonnie Brier
Secretary