from the world of politics and business. It is a textured listening to all of the corporate structures of one’s life and then acting before a cloud of witnesses, whether visible or not.

To take responsibility for our lives is an attempt to do more than is possible. Such an attempt brings on despair among the downtrodden, hubris among the well off. To accept responsibility for the next step in our lives, based on trust in our friends and fallible knowledge of our own selves, is both possible and necessary. Every responsible action makes possible a more responsible life. Every particular act of responsibility makes credible a universal responsibility. A morality thus lived is deeply relative and therefore increasingly universal.

Notes

Chapter One

5. Newt Gingrich, To Renew America (San Francisco: HarperCollins, 1995), 105. In direct opposition to this Republican vision, Gingrich posits the “counter-cultural left” and its all-powerful society. “In their view ‘society’ is always responsible for everything” (p. 38).
Notes to Chapters One and Two

17. A study by the American Hospital Association estimated that 70 percent of deaths in hospitals are negotiated; see *New York Times*, December 9, 1990.
23. The main polls over the decades have been the National Fertility Studies, Gallup Polls, and National Opinion Research Center surveys; for a summary of these, see Mary Ann Glendon, *Abortion and Divorce in Western Law* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1987), 41; see also *The Abortion Dispute and the American System* (Washington: Brookings Institution, 1983); E. J. Dionne, *Why Americans Hate Politics* (New York: Touchstone, 1992), 341–43.
27. Ibid., 78.

Chapter Two


Notes to Chapter Two

7. Ibid.
24. Ibid., 207.
25. Ibid., 155.
26. Ibid., 264.
27. Ibid., 252.
33. Ibid., 710.
44. Ibid., 301.
45. Ibid., 309.
46. Ibid., 308.
49. Ibid., 308.
52. The man who was most influential in the use of the term was not unaware of the criticism. W. A. Visser ’t Hooft, *The Ten Formative Years 1938–48* (Geneva: World Council of Churches, 1948), 9: "A responsible society is one where freedom is the freedom of men who acknowledge responsibility to justice and public order, and where those who hold political authority or economic power are responsible for its exercise to God and the people whose welfare is affected by it." Visser ’t Hooft continued in *The Evanston Report* (New York: Harper and Brothers, 1955) to try to refine the meaning of "responsible" ("a criterion to judge existing social orders") and he had not given up in the 1960s when rebellion against the term became obvious.
55. Ibid., 158.
63. Ibid., 68.
65. Ibid., 57.
Notes to Chapters Two and Three

66. "A being not only knows itself in relation to other selves but exists as self only in that relation." Ibid., 71.
69. Carol Gilligan, In a Different Voice, chapter 2, 24–63.
72. Carol Gilligan, In a Different Voice, 101.

Chapter Three

3. Bruce Waller, Freedom without Responsibility (Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 1990), 65 (italics are mine). As for what moral responsibility means, Waller writes on p. 73 that "'moral responsibility' justifies or even requires special treatment or special deserts.”
4. Ibid., 73. In this distinction "moral-judgment responsible focuses on the process by which responsibility is assigned" (p. 74).
5. Waller’s book is thus a variation on a theme that runs from Jeremy Bentham to B. F. Skinner, that is, the unfairness and ineffectiveness of blame and punishment. But Skinner’s position is that the way to get rid of responsibility is to deny its premise: freedom. See B. F. Skinner, Beyond Freedom and Dignity (Hammondsworth: Penguin Books, 1973), 25, 206.
9. The report is entitled “The Unspoken Tragedy: Firearm Suicide in the United States.” It was issued on June 3, 1995 by the Educational Fund to End Handgun Violence and the Coalition to Stop Gun Violence.
15. Ibid., 146.
21. As in the documentary films by Frederick Wiseman or in Robert Coles’s books that stay close to the interviewee’s words.
23. Ibid., 114.
33. Ibid., 16.
34. Fyodor Dostoyevsky, Brothers Karamazov, 537.
Notes to Chapters Three and Four

42. Ibid., 26; see also Christopher Lasch, *The Revolt of the Elites* (New York: Norton, 1995), 89: “We are so busy defending our rights (rights conferred for the most part by judicial decree) that we give little thought to our responsibilities”; see also the “Bill of Rights and Responsibilities for Learning,” drawn up by the American Federation of Teachers: *New York Times*, September 10, 1995, E8.

Notes to Chapter Four

6. Ibid., 63.
12. A. E. Taylor, *The Mind of Plato* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1964), 97. Plato has often been understood to have a simplistic notion of one good and one bad element. One of his most famous images is of a charioteer trying to control two horses going in opposite directions (*Phaedrus* 246–57). That image can have varying interpretations. But in the above paragraph I am referring to Plato’s description in the Republic of two conflicting elements and a mediating third.
13. Romans 7:15.

Chapter Four

1. In Newt Gingrich, Dick Armey, and others, *Contract with America*, 9–10, it is noteworthy that the proposal for welfare reform starts with a heading of “personal responsibility” but ends with the aim “to promote individual responsibility.”
2. “The problems of the human heart in conflict with itself... alone can
Notes to Chapter Four

26. Larry May, Sharing Responsibility, 34.
33. Protagoras 324a-c.
37. Ironically, the Constitutional Court of South Africa, in abolishing capital punishment, quoted judges and authors from the United States. These included William Brennan from the 1972 case of Furman vs. Georgia: “a society that wishes to prevent crime . . . not to kill criminals simply to get even with them.” Newsday, June 29, 1995, 41.
40. Bruce Waller, Freedom without Responsibility, 184.
41. Surely one of the best books ever written on the immorality of capital punishment is Helen Prejean, Dead Man Walking (New York: Vintage, 1993).
42. Aristotle, Nicomachean Ethics 1109b30-1111b5; see also Hannah Arendt, Willing, 16-19.
43. Quoted in Bernard Weisberger, They Gathered at the River (Boston: Little, Brown, 1958), 211; see also Richard Hofstadter, Anti-Intellectualism in America (New York: Vintage Books, 1963), 111.
44. In British English one more often “takes” a decision, although “makes” has made inroads.
48. David Dennett, Elbow Room, 157, referring to Thomas Aquinas De Ver. q. 23, a. 4; see also Augustine, The Enchiridion: On Faith, Hope and Love (Chicago: Regenery, 1961), 123: “Now, it was expedient that man should be at first so created, as to have it in his power to will what was right and to will what was wrong . . . But in the future life it shall not be in his power to will evil; and yet this will constitute no restriction on the freedom of his will. On the contrary, his will shall be much freer when it shall be wholly impossible for him to be the slave of sin.” For the history of the attempt in Christianity to reconcile freedom and necessity, see Leszek Kolakowski, God Owes Us Nothing (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1995).
51. Mary Midgley, Beast and Man, 267.
52. Ibid., 265.
56. Aristotle, Nicomachean Ethics 1113b.
Notes to Chapters Four and Five


Chapter Five

10. Emile Dürkheim, Education and Sociology (Glencoe, N.Y.: Free Press, 1956), 123; not surprisingly, Durkheim places sociology in charge of education: “The role of sociology is predominant in the determination of the ends that education should follow” (p. 129).
11. Glenn Loury, One by One from the Inside Out, 29. Christopher Lasch (Revolt of the Elites, 106) criticizes the communitarians by saying “that they seem to be more interested in the responsibility of the community as a whole—its responsibility, say, to its least fortunate members—than in the responsibility of individuals.” In this statement Lasch mistakenly sees this contrast as whole to part, but what his own language reveals is two different

meanings of responsibility, namely, the responsibility of the community to the least fortunate and the responsibility of individuals for their actions.
12. For the history of “society” from the Greeks down to the present, see Hannah Arendt, The Human Condition, 38–49.
20. Peter French, Responsibility Matters, 137.
23. Frederick Taylor, The Principles of Scientific Management (New York: Harper and Brothers, 1911); on the application of this theory to the school, see Alan Tom, Teaching as a Moral Craft (New York: Longman, 1984), 16–19.
28. Ibid., xi.
33. Victor Frankl, Man’s Search for Meaning, 174.
38. Michael Walzer, The Revolution of the Saints (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1965), 196: “The Puritan transformation of the family remained incomplete; so long as children were born, instead of appearing voluntarily like colonists in a new country, the family could not become a purely political society.”
42. Mary Ann Glendon, Abortion and Divorce in Western Law.
48. Newt Gingrich’s To Renew America is an all too typical case of this confusion. Early in the book (p. 37), he writes that “America must be described in romantic terms… To me America is a romance which we all participate.” That would be a fine sentiment if in the rest of the book Gingrich did not use “America” to refer to an existing nation state. The eight-page introduction uses “America(n)” thirty-nine times; never once does the Speaker of the U.S. House of Representatives refer to the United States. In the page and a half chapter, Individual versus Group Rights, “America” appears fifteen times, the “United States” not at all.
50. Shabbat 54b.
57. Christopher Stone has proposed reforms that would require greater flow of information within companies, thus reducing the plea of ignorance; see Where the Law Ends: The Social Control of Corporate Behavior (New York: Harper and Row, 1975).
58. Peter French, Responsibility Matters, 97.
59. Aristotle, Nicomachean Ethics 114a; Peter French, Collective and Corporate Responsibility, 164.
60. James Coleman, Asymmetric Society, 104–11.

Chapter Six

2. It should be noted that some early humanists, including Montaigne, did argue that animals should be treated humanely; see Montaigne’s “Essay on Cruelty” in The Essays of Michel De Montaigne (New York: Knopf, 1935), 2. 92–93.
6. Friedrich Schweitzer, Ethics and Civilization, 2. 255.
given dominion over all life and nonlife, enjoined to subdue the earth. The cosmos is thought to be a pyramid erected to support man upon its pinnacle. . . . "


33. Ibid., 174.


36. Edward O. Wilson (*The Diversity of Life* [Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1992], 280) makes a conservative estimate that the rate of extinction worldwide is 27,000 species a year.


39. Natalie Angier (*The Beauty of the Beastly* [Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1995], 118) notes that “cockroach researchers need never fear that animal rights activists will break into their lab at midnight to liberate their experimental subjects.”


41. Elizabeth Marshall Thomas, *The Tribe of Tiger*, 133; Lewis Thomas, *Late Night Thoughts on Listening to Mahler’s Ninth Symphony* (New York: Viking Books, 1983), 36: Concerning the horse, Clever Hans, who it was discovered could not really count but was watching his experimenter’s behavior for clues, Lewis reflects: “He was considerably better at observing human beings and interpreting their behavior than humans are at comprehending animals or, for that matter, other humans.”


44. Wendell Berry, *The Unsettling of America* (San Francisco: Sierra Club, 1977), 85.
50. An exception would be Robert Nisbet, Twilight of Authority (New York: Oxford University Press, 1975), 238–39, where hierarchy is presented as “an ineradicable element of the social bond.”
52. Ibid., 60.
54. Michael Walzer (Thick and Thin, 98) says “there is no linearity, then, and no hierarchy. The order of the self is better imagined as a thickly populated circle, with me in the center surrounded by my self-entities who stand at different temporal and spatial removes.” A circle still has “linearity” and, I would also claim, hierarchy. But for such a hierarchy of a “thickly populated” self, a sphere would be a better image than a circle.
56. John Passmore, Man’s Responsibility for Nature, 187, is right in saying that ethics has “to be justified by reference to human interests.” That is not necessarily a “utilitarian” position. It simply acknowledges that unless a reality is related to human interest it cannot be spoken of ethically. “Inter-es” means to be related to us. To say “a being has intrinsic worth apart from humans” is still a human judgment.
58. Many writers on ecology are oblivious of this meaning of uniqueness. For example, Eric Freyfogle, Justice and the Earth (New York: Free Press, 1995), 72: “We should be quick to note that many modern ethicists believe that humans are sui generis—unique—and that moral worth does not extend beyond humans. We can refer to these philosophers as the exclusivists.” One has only to consult the use of “unique” in writers such as Lewis Thomas, Wendell Berry, or Loren Eiseley to show that Freyfogle has completely misunderstood the word.
60. Ibid., 232.

Chapter Seven

15. As in Marx: “The tradition of all dead generations weighs like a nightmare on the brain of the living.”
17. Yosef Yerushalmi, Zakhor: Jewish History and Jewish Memory (Seattle: University of Washington Press, 1982), 82.


29. The United States never considered using the atomic bomb against Germany. However, historians have not found racist reasons for the decision; at least at a conscious level, the reasons were military. See Martin Sherwin, *The World Destroyed: The Atomic Bomb and the Grand Alliance* (New York: Vintage Books, 1975).

30. Michael Walzer, *Just and Unjust Wars* (New York: Basic Books, 1977); James Johnson, *Just War Traditions and the Restraint of War* (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1981); when the United States government acceded to Japanese requests not to use “V-J Day,” the *London Times*, March 8, 1995, pronounced: “The fact that Japan was defeated in a just war is inescapable; it cannot be buried in polite euphemism.” That Japan was defeated is an inescapable fact; that World War II was a “just war” is a claim based on theory.


35. Ibid., 314.

36. Theodore Draper (“The Abuse of McNamara,” *New York Review of Books*, May 25, 1995, 16–17) makes the legitimate point that McNamara’s opposition to the war was made known by the publication of The Pentagon Papers in 1971. Very few people, however, mastered the contents of that document. Draper also objects to the “vitiologic” editorial of the *New York Times* and similar attacks. However inadequate the apology may be, official acknowledgment of failure should not be met with contempt.


44. The Council of Trent, for example, said that “The purpose of the Passion and Death of the Son of God our Saviour was to redeem the sins of all time . . . The sinners were the authors, the instruments, as it were, of all the sorrows he endures.” The contemporary catechism in referring to “Jesus” rather than “the Son of God our Saviour” makes it more difficult for Jews to recognize the statement as theological.

45. Jules Isaac (*The Teaching of Contempt* [New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1964], 122–23) cites Charles Peguy’s statement that “it was not the Jews who crucified Jesus Christ, but all our sins; and the Jews, who were only the instrument, partake with the others at the font of salvation.” Isaac is appreciative of the evident good intention of Peguy’s, but the Jews still end up as the instrument.


Notes to Chapter Seven

54. Ibid., 10.
56. Ibid., 145.
59. Dietrich Bonhoeffer, Ethics, 234.
61. Edmund Morgan, The Puritan Family (New York: Harper Torch, 1966), 75–79; Morgan notes that girls were also included in this process although they were not learning a trade (p. 76).
69. In a disputed Supreme Court decision allowing a high school to test athletes for drugs, Justice Antonin Scalia cited “the schools’ custodial and tutelary responsibility for the children.” New York Times, June 27, 1995, p. B6. This claim is not surprising, given the history of the court’s attitude to schoolchildren’s rights. Nevertheless, it seems to me a terrible violation of the right to privacy when there is no reasonable cause.
75. Alan Tom, Teaching as a Moral Craft, 80.
76. An influential book in the 1960s and republished in 1978 is entitled

Notes to Chapters Seven and Eight

Values and Teaching (Columbus, Ohio: Merrill), but the authors Louis Raths, Merrill Harmin, and Sidney Simon are about advising “teachers” not to teach. They assume children will develop their own “values.” But “it is entirely possible that children will choose not to develop values. It is the teacher’s responsibility to support this choice also.” (p. 47). On adult education, see Malcolm Knowles, Self-Directed Learning (New York: Association), 1975; William Reinsmith, Archetypal Forms in Teaching (Westport, Conn.: Greenwood, 1992), 158–59: “However the case may be, the fact remains that once students take responsibility for their own learning teaching sooner or later will come to an end... To put it another way: In the last analysis there is no teaching, only learning. And all learning is self-taught.” The last sentence would seem to contradict the next to last.

77. Carl Rogers, Freedom to Learn for the 80s (Columbus, Ohio: Merrill, 1983), 137.
78. Newt Gingrich’s To Renew America joins this literature attacking teaching. In the second wave of history, the teacher was active, the student passive. In the coming third wave, “responsibility is placed on the learner rather than on the teacher” (p. 143).

Chapter Eight

3. Northrop Frye, The Educated Imagination (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1964), 64. Sidney Lumet makes the point in criticizing Hollywood’s confusing of generality and universality; in contrast, he writes of Carl Dreyer’s “Passion of Joan of Arc”: “The more confined and the specific the choices were, the more universal the results became.” See Sidney Lumet, Making Movies (New York: Knopf, 1995).
9. Matthew Arnold, Literature and Dogma (New York: Macmillan, 1883), xxvii; compare the first sentence of Alfred North Whitehead’s Aims of Educa-
Notes to Chapter Eight

1. "Culture is activity of thought, and receptiveness to beauty and humane feeling." The essay was first published in 1917.


17. E. E. Evans-Pritchard, Nuer Religion (London: Oxford University Press, 1956), 84: A deformed baby was declared to be a hippopotamus and could therefore be drowned.


21. Seble Dawit and Salem Mekuria, "The West Just Doesn't Get It," New York Times, December 8, 1993; see the comments of Clifford Gertz in David Berreby, "The Unabsolute Truths of Clifford Gertz, New York Times Magazine, April 9, 1995, 46: "Look, I think clitoridectomy is a horrible business. . . . But what we are going to do? Invade the horn of Africa and arrest everybody. If you’re serious about addressing this, you ask people there about the practice and you listen to them. You listen to women from there who justify the practice. You want to change things, you don’t start by proclaiming that you possess the truth. That’s not very helpful.”


Notes to Chapter Eight

27. Ibid., 253.

28. Ibid., 253.


33. On the question of shame, see Christopher Lasch, The Revolt of the Elites, 197–212.

34. See David Remnick, Lenin’s Tomb (New York: Random House, 1993), 279–89.

35. Frederick Binder and David Reimers, All the Nations Under Heaven: An Ethnic and Racial History of New York City. (New York: Columbia University Press, 1995). In the 1640s, when there were one thousand people, there were already eighteen languages. A letter from Minister Megapolensis to the Synod of Amsterdam in 1655 says that there is already too much diversity on Manhattan Island and “it would create a still greater confusion if the obstinate and immovable Jews came to settle here.” See Edwin Gaustad, A Documentary History of Religion in America (Grand Rapids, Mich.: Eerdmans, 1982), 86.