

Prof. Elisabeth Wood
Department of Politics
New York University

Fall 2002
9/9/02

G53.1500: COMPARATIVE POLITICS

This course, an introduction to the study of comparative politics for Ph.D students, examines the purpose and methodology of comparative inquiry. Designed to introduce students to the study of comparative politics and to assist students in developing research topics and strategies, the course surveys a range of methodological approaches and explores key themes -- the origins of political regimes and other institutions, the politics of redistribution, and the logic of collective action -- through the critical reading and discussion of classic, contemporary, and unpublished works, supplemented with contemporary readings on social science methods.

Class Meeting: Tuesday 2:00- 4:00

Office Hours: Tuesday 4:30 - 6:30 (sign up on office door, except for September 17 11-12:30, September 24 12-1 and 6:30-7:30, and November 26 11-1), Rm. 415, Politics Department, 715 Broadway, 998-8534

Email address: ew2@nyu.edu.

Requirements:

1. Reviews of the reading. For six of the weeks of the course each participant will write a short review of the week's reading or a subset of the reading. Reviews should include a concise summary of the argument and evidence, should assess its strengths and weaknesses, and raise questions for discussion. Consider questions such as: What comparative strategy or design is employed? What precisely is being compared? Is there an identified set of comparative cases? Is the comparison explicit, and if so how were the cases selected? Is there an implicit comparative design? Does the work principally generate ideas, test causal hypotheses, or develop theory, or some combination of these? Does the author appear to believe the conclusions of the study are generalizable? What evidence is presented that is said to confirm or disconfirm the author's argument? Can you suggest a further or better way to evaluate the author's claims?

Reviews should be two (not more) single-spaced pages. One copy of the review should be left in the instructor's mailbox by 6:00 p.m. Monday. Another copy should be sent by email to the instructor and the class.

2. Writing assignment. Two short papers (8-12 pages) that further explore two themes of the course. Participants are required to submit an initial outline and bibliography at least a week before the paper is due. Alternatively, the student may choose to write a single research paper on a topic approved by the instructor, or to submit a final exam (distributed with this syllabus) at the end of the course.

3. Class presentation. Participants will make occasional short presentations of the week's reading to the class. Each presentation (no more than 10 minutes) should briefly summarize the argument and assess the work's strengths and weaknesses, addressing questions similar to those listed above under the description of reviews.

Course Materials:

Books available for purchase at the NYU Book Center:

Anthony Marx. *Making Race and Nation*.
Elisabeth Wood. *Forging Democracy from Below*
Carles Boix. *Political Parties, Growth and Equality*
Jeff Goodwin. *No Other Way Out*.
Evelyn Huber and John D. Stephens. *Development and Crisis of the Welfare State*.
David D. Laitin. *Identity in Formation*.

Books recommended for purchase:

Gary King, et. al. *Designing Social Inquiry*.
Wayne Booth, et.al., *The Craft of Research*

Course Outline

I. September 10. Introduction

II. September 17. Mill's Method of Difference

John S. Mill. Two Methods of Comparison. In *A System of Logic* [1846], reprinted in Amitai Etzioni and F. Dubow eds. *Comparative Perspectives: Theories and Methods*, pp. 205-213. Little, Brown and Company, 1969.

Robert Putnam. 1993. *Making Democracy Work: Civic Traditions in Modern Italy*, Chapters 1, 3, and 4. Princeton.

Kathryn Firmin-Sellers. 2000. Institutions, Context, and Outcomes: Explaining French and British Rule in West Africa. *Comparative Politics* 32(3): 253-262.

Barbara Geddes. Comparison in the Context of a Game Theoretic Argument. In Bowen and Peterson, *Critical Comparisons in Politics and Culture*, pp. 196-229. Cambridge, 1999.

recommended:

Richard Snyder. 2001. Scaling Down: The Sub-national Comparative Method. *Studies in Comparative International Development* 36(1).

Mark I. Lichbach and Alan S. Zuckerman. Research traditions and theory in comparative politics: an introduction. In Lichbach and Zuckerman, eds. *Comparative Politics. Rationality, Culture, and Structure*. Cambridge, 1997.

Giovanni Sartori. Concept Misformation in Comparative Politics. *American Political Science Review* LXIV (4),(December 1970): 1033-53.

Ronald Chilcote. *Theories of Comparative Politics*. Westview, 1994.

Thomas Kuhn. *The Structure of Scientific Revolutions*. Chicago, 1962 and 1970.

A. Lijphart. Comparative Politics and the Comparative Method. *American Political Science Review* LXV: 3 (September 1971): 682-693.

Arend Lijphart. The Comparable-Cases Strategy in Comparative Research. *Comparative Political Studies* 8, 1975.

Alasdair MacIntyre. The Character of Generalizations in Social Science and Their Lack of Predictive Power. In Alasdair MacIntyre, *After Virtue: A Study in Moral Theory*. Pps. 88-108. Notre Dame, 1984.

Frederic C. Schaffer. *Democracy in Translation: Understanding Politics in an Unfamiliar Culture*. Cornell, 1998.

III. September 24. Mill's Method of Agreement

Elisabeth J. Wood. 2000. *Forging Democracy from Below: Insurgent Transitions in South Africa and El Salvador*. Cambridge.

Recommended:

John Glenn. 2001. *Framing Democracy: Civil Society and Civic Movements in Eastern Europe*. Stanford.

Barbara Geddes. What Do We Know About Democratization After Twenty Years? *Annual Review of Political Science* 2:115-144, 1999.

Adam Przeworski. *Democracy and the Market*. Cambridge, 1991.

Nancy Bermeo. Rethinking Regime Change. *Comparative Politics*. (April 1990): 359-377.

Guillermo O'Donnell and Philippe C. Schmitter. *Transitions from Authoritarian Rule: Tentative Conclusions*. Johns Hopkins, 1986.

Dankwart Rustow. Transitions to Democracy: Toward a Dynamic Model. *Comparative Politics* 2(3), pps. 337-363, 1970.

Terry Karl. Dilemmas of Democratization. *Comparative Politics* 23(1), pps. 1-21, October 1990.

Collier, Ruth. *Paths Toward Democracy: The Working Class and Elites in Western Europe and South America*. Cambridge, 1999.

Samuel Huntington. *The Third Wave: Democratization in the Late Twentieth Century*. Oklahoma, 1991.

Michael Bratton and Nicolas van de Walle. *Democratic Experiments in Africa*. Cambridge, 1997.

IV. October 1. Combining Mill's methods: state formation

Anthony Marx. 1998. *Making Race and Nation: A Comparison of the United States, South Africa, and Brazil*. Cambridge

Recommended:

Jeffrey Herbst. 2000. *States and Power in Africa*. Princeton

Barrington Moore, Jr. 1966. *Social Origins of Dictatorship and Democracy*. Beacon.

Margaret Levi. 1988. *Of Rule and Revenue*. California

Steven L. Solnick. *Stealing the State: Control and Collapse in Soviet Institutions*. Harvard, 1998.

Karl Polanyi. *The Great Transformation*. Rinehart, 1944.

Guillermo A. O'Donnell. *Modernization and Bureaucratic Authoritarianism*. University of California, 1979.

Seymour Martin Lipset. Economic Development and Democracy, Chapter II of *Political Man*. Johns Hopkins, 1981.

V. October 8. Comparative Method, Design and Theory

Charles Ragin. *The Comparative Method*. Chapters 2,3,4 and 5; pages 19 - 84. University of California, 1987.

Gary King, Robert O. Keohane, and Sidney Verba. *Designing Social Inquiry: Scientific Inference in Qualitative Research*. Chapters 1-3. Princeton, 1994.

Margaret Levi. 1997. A Model, a Method, and a Map: Rational Choice in Comparative and Historical Analysis. In Lichbach and Zuckerman, eds. *Comparative Politics. Rationality, Culture, and Structure*. Cambridge.

Evan S. Lieberman. Seeing Both the Forest and the Trees: Nested Analysis in Cross-National Research. Paper prepared for delivery at the 2002 Annual Meeting of the American Political Science Association, Boston, August 29-September 1, 2002.

Alasdair MacIntyre, Is a science of comparative politics possible? In *Against the Self-Images of the Age*. Schocken Books, 1971.

Recommended:

Atul Kohli, Peter Evans, Peter J. Katzenstein, Adam Przeworski, Susanne Hoerber Rudolph, James C. Scott, and Theda Skocpol. The Role of Theory in Comparative Politics: A Symposium. *World Politics*, 48(1): 1-49, 1995.

Charles C. Ragin. 1997. Turning the Tables: How Case-oriented Research Challenges Variable-oriented Research. In *Comparative Social Research*, vol. 16, 1997.

James Mahoney. 1999. Nominal, Ordinal, and Narrative Appraisal in Macrocausal Analysis. *American Journal of Sociology*. 104(4):1154-96.

Mark I. and Alan s. Zuckerman, eds. *Comparative Politics. Rationality, Culture, and Structure*. Cambridge, 1997.

The Qualitative-Quantitative Disputation: Gary King, Robert O. Keohane and Sidney Verba's *Designing Social Inquiry*. *American Political Science Review* 89:2, 467-470, 1995.

Adam Przeworski and Henry Teune. *The Logic of Comparative Inquiry*. Wiley, 1970.

Bear F. Braumoeller. Explaining Variance: Or, Stuck in a Moment We Can't Get Out Of. Paper prepared for delivery at the 2002 Annual Meeting of the American Political Science Association, Boston, August 29-September 1, 2002.

Clifford Geertz, Thick Description: Towards an Interpretive Theory of Culture. In Geertz, *The Interpretation of Cultures*. Basic Books, 1973.

VI. October 15. Politics of redistribution in advanced democracies I.

Carles Boix. 1998. *Political Parties, Growth and Equality: Conservative and Social Democratic Economic Strategies in the World Economy*. Cambridge.

Due: abstract, outline, and bibliography for first paper.

Recommended (mostly redistribution in developing countries):

Nicolas van de Walle. 2001. *African Economies and the Politics of Permanent Crisis, 1979-1999*. Cambridge.

Quah, Danny T. 1996. Twin Peaks: Growth and Convergence in Models of Distribution Dynamics. *The Economic Journal* 106: 1045-1055.

Landes, David S. 1990. Why are We So Rich and They So Poor? *American Economic Review* 80: 1 - 13.

Collier, Paul, and Jan Willem Gunning. 1999. Explaining African Economic Performance. *Journal of Economic Literature* 37: 64-111.

Patrick Heller. Degrees of Democracy: Some Comparative Lessons from India. *World Politics* 52: 484-519, 2000

S. Sengupta and H. Gazdar. Agrarian Politics and Rural Development in West Bengal. In Jean Dreze and Amartya Sen, eds., *Indian Development: Selected Regional Perspectives*. Oxford, 1996.

Kurt Weyland. *Democracy Without Equity. Failures of Reform in Brazil*. Pittsburgh, 1996.

Joel Hellman. Winners Take All: The Politics of Partial Reform in Postcommunist TransitionsI *World Politics* 50: 203-234, 1998.

VII. October 22. Politics of redistribution in advanced democracies II.

Evelyn Huber and John D. Stephens. *Development and Crisis of the Welfare State: Parties and Policies in Global Markets*. 2001. Chicago.

Due: first paper.

Recommended:

Torben Iversen. 1999. *Contested Economic Institutions: The Politics of Macroeconomics and Wage Bargaining in Advanced Democracies*. Cambridge.

Dietrich Rueschmeyer, Evelyne Huber Stephens and John D. Stephens. *Capitalist Development and Democracy*. Chicago, 1992.

Gregory M. Luebbert. *Liberalism, Fascism, or Social Democracy*. Oxford, 1991.

Adam Przeworski and Fernando Limongi. Political Regimes and Economic Growth. *Journal of Economic Perspectives*, 7(3) pp. 51-70, 1993.

Theda Skocpol and Margaret Sommers, The Use of Comparative History in Macro-Social Theory. *Comparative Studies in Society and History* 20(6): 817-856, 1981.

VIII. October 29. Collective action and society: revolutionary mobilization

Elisabeth J. Wood. *Insurgent Collective Action and Civil War in El Salvador*. Cambridge, forthcoming.

John Gerring. 2002. What is a Case Study and What is it Good For? Paper prepared for delivery at the 2002 Annual Meeting of the American Political Science Association, Boston, August 29-September 1, 2002.

Recommended:

Calhoun, Craig. 1991. The problem of identity in collective action. In Joan Huber, ed., *Macro-Micro Linkages in Sociology*, pps. 51-75. Newbury Park, Calif. Sage Publications.

Guha, Ranajit, 1983. *Elementary Aspects of Peasant Insurgency in Colonial India*. Delhi: Oxford University Press.

Mark I. Lichbach and Adam Seligman. 2000. *Market and Community: The Basis of Social Revolution, and Relegitimation*. Pennsylvania State.

Elinor Ostrom. 1998. A Behavioral Approach to the Rational-Choice Theory of Collective Action. *American Political Science Review* 92, 1: 1-22.

Bowles, Samuel. 1998. Endogenous Preferences: The Cultural Consequences of Markets and Other Economic Institutions. *Journal of Economic Literature*. 36(1): 75-111.

Roger Gould. 1995. *Insurgent Identities: Class, Community and Protest in Paris from 1848 to the Commune*. Chicago.

Russell Hardin. *Collective Action*. Johns Hopkins, 1982.

Gay W. Seidman, 1994. *Manufacturing Militance: Worker's Movements in Brazil and South Africa, 1970-1985*. University of California.

Michael Taylor. Rationality and revolutionary collective action. In Michael Taylor, ed., *Rationality and Revolution*, pps. 63-97, 1988.

Adam Przeworski. Proletarian into a Class: The Process of Class Formation, Chapter 2 of *Capitalism and Social Democracy*. Cambridge, 1985.

Carole Pateman. *Participation and Democratic Theory*. Cambridge, 1970.

Donna della Porta. *Social Movements, Political Violence and the State*. Cambridge.

Margaret R. Somers. Narrativity, Narrative Identity, and Social Action: Rethinking English Working Class Formation. *Social Science History* 16, 4: 591 - 630, 1992.

Claus Offe and Helmut Wieselth. Two Logics of Collective Action: theoretical notes on social class and organizational form. *Political Power and Social Theory* 1, 1980.

Doug McAdam. *Political Process and the Development of Black Insurgency, 1930-1970*. Chicago, 1982.

IX. November 5. Collective action and the state: revolutions

Jeff Goodwin. 2001. *No Other Way Out: States and Revolutionary Movements, 1945-1991*. Cambridge

Recommended:

Theda Skocpol. 1979. *States and Social Revolutions: a comparative analysis of France, China, and Russia*. Cambridge.

Wickham-Crowley, Timothy P. 1992. *Guerrillas and Revolution in Latin America: A Comparative Study of Insurgents and Regimes Since 1956*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.

John Markoff. 1996. *The Abolition of Feudalism*. Pennsylvania State.

Roger Gould. *Insurgent Identities: Class, Community and Protest in Paris from 1848 to the Commune*. Chicago, 1995.

X. November 12. Ethnic politics and collective identity

David Laitin. *Identity in Formation*. Cornell, 1998.

Recommended:

Marc Howard Ross. 1997. Culture and Identity in Comparative Political Analysis. In Mark Lichbach and A. S. Zuckerman, eds., *Comparative Politics: Rationality, Culture, and Structure*. Cambridge.

Elise Giuliano. Who Determines the Self in the Politics of Self-Determination? Identity and Preference Formation in Tatarstan's Nationalist Mobilization. *Comparative Politics* 32(3): 295-316, 2000.

Jim Jasper and Francesca Polletta, 2001. Collective Identity and Social Movements. *Annual Review of Sociology*. 27: 283-305.

Sidney Tarrow, 1992. Mentalities, Political Cultures, and Collective Action Frames: Constructing Meanings Through Action. In Aldon Morris and Carol McClurg Mueller, eds., *Frontiers in Social Movement Theory*. Yale.

Verta Taylor and Nancy E. Whittier, 1992. Collective Identity in Social Movement Communities: Lesbian Feminist Mobilization. In Aldon Morris and Carol McClurg Mueller, eds., *Frontiers in Social Movement Theory*. Yale.

Alessandro Pizzorno, 1978. Political Exchange and Collective Identity in Industrial Conflict. In C. Crouch and A. Pizzorno, eds. *The Resurgence of Class Conflict in Western Europe since 1968*, Vol. 2 (MacMillan): 277-298.

David A. Snow and Robert D. Benford, 1992. Master Frames and Cycles of Protest. In Aldon Morris and Carol McClurg Mueller, eds., *Frontiers in Social Movement Theory*. Yale.

Adam Przeworski, 1985. Proletarian into a Class: The Process of Class Formation, Chapter 2 of *Capitalism and Social Democracy*. Cambridge

E.P. Thompson, 1971. Moral Economy of the English Crowd. *Past and Present* 50: 76-136.

Jean L. Cohen, 1985. Strategy or Identity: New Theoretical Paradigms and Contemporary Social Movements. *Social Research* 52 (4).

XI. November 19. Electoral politics, collective identity, and ethnic political mobilization

Daniel N. Posner. *The Institutional Origins of Ethnic Politics: Regime Change and Ethnic Cleavages in Africa*. Unpublished book manuscript.

Margaret Levi. 1999. Producing an Analytic Narrative. In Bowen and Peterson, *Critical Comparisons in Politics and Culture*, pp. 152-172. Cambridge.

Recommended:

Robert H. Bates et al. 1998. *Analytic Narratives*. Princeton.

Jon Elster. 2000. Rational Choice History: A Case of Excessive Ambition. *APSR* 94(3): 685-95.

XII. November 26. Electoral politics and ethnic mobilization

Steven Wilkinson. *The Electoral Incentives for Ethnic Violence*. Unpublished book manuscript.

Andrew Bennett. 2002. Where the Model Frequently Meets the Road: Combining Statistical, Formal, and Case Study Methods. Paper prepared for delivery at the 2002 Annual Meeting of the American Political Science Association, Boston, August 29-September 1, 2002.

Due: abstract, outline, and bibliography of second paper.

Recommended:

Donald L. Horowitz, ed.. 2000. *Ethnic Groups in Conflict*. California.

Beverly Crawford and Ronnie D. Lipschutz, eds. *The Myth of Ethnic Conflict: Politics, Economics and Cultural Violence*. Berkeley, 1999.

David Lake and Donald Rothchild. 1996. Containing Fear: The Origins and Mangement of Ethnic Conflict. *International Security* 21(2): 41-75.

Ashutosh Varshney. 2002. *Ethnic Conflict and Civic Life: Hindus and Muslims in India*. Yale.

Russell Hardin. *One For All: The Logic of Group Conflict*. Princeton, 1995.

XIII. December 3. Civil War Violence

Stathis Kalyvas. *The Logic of Violence in Civil War*. Unpublished book manuscript.

Recommended:

Stathis Kalyvas. Wanton and Senseless? The Logic of Massacres in Algeria. *Rationality and Society*. 1999.

James Fearon. Commitment Problems and the Spread of Ethnic Conflict. In David Lake and Donald Rothchild, eds. *The International Spread of Ethnic Conflict: Fear Diffusion, and Escalation*.

Russell Hardin. *One For All: The Logic of Group Conflict*. Princeton, 1995.

Nicolas Sambanis. 2001. Do Ethnic and Nonethnic Civil Wars Have the Same Causes? *Journal of Conflict Resolution*. 45(4): 259-82.

XIV. December 10. Conclusion

Gary King, et. al. *Designing Social Inquiry*. Chapter 4. Princeton, 1994.

Charles C. Ragin. 2000. *Fuzzy Set Social Science*. Chapters 1-5. Chicago.

James Fearon. Counterfactuals and Hypothesis Testing in Political Science. *World Politics* 43: 169-195, 1991.

Paul Pierson. Increasing Returns, Path Dependence, and the Study of Politics. *American Political Science Review*, 94, 2: 251-267, 2000.

Recommended:

Charles C. Ragin. 2000. *Fuzzy-Set Social Science*, Part Two. Chicago.

James Mahoney. 2000. Path Dependence in Historical sociology. *Theory and Society* 29: 507-48.

Second paper due December 16 by 10 a.m. by email attachment.

