



**Minutes of a Stated Meeting of the  
Senate of New York University  
December 13, 2018**

A stated meeting of the Senate of New York University was held on Thursday, December 13, 2018, at 9 a.m., in the Colloquium Room of the Global Center for Academic and Spiritual Life, 238 Thompson Street. The meeting was convened with President Andrew Hamilton in the chair.

**Tenured/Tenure Track Faculty Senators Council (“T-FSC”) Members Present:** Wen Ling (Chair), Sylvain Cappell, Sonia Das, Fabienne Doucet, Nick Economides, Stephen Figlewski, David Irving, Angela Kamer, Robert Lapiner, Beatrice Longuenesse, Darcey Merritt, Marilyn Nonken (for Arvind Rajagopal), Niyati Parekh, Dara Regaignon, Carol Reiss (for Jim Uleman), Andrew Romig, Tamar Schlick (for Daniel Tranchina), Allison Squires (for Jacquelyn Taylor), and Amanda Watson.

**Full-Time Continuing Contract Faculty Senators Council (“C-FSC”) Members Present:** Mary Killilea (Chair), Lauren Davis, Angela De Bartolo, Michael Ferguson, Sam Howard-Spink, Scott Illingworth, Leila Jahangiri, Mitchell Joachim, Jung Kim, Ashley Maynor (for Laura Leone), Robin Mitnick, Maria Patterson, Vincent Renzi, Iskender Sahin (for Tommy Lee), Antonios Saravanos, Geoff Shullenberger (for Noelle Molé Liston), Deepak Unnikrishnan, Xingyu Wang, Beverly Watkins, Heidi White, Andrew Williams, and Ethan Youngerman.

**Student Senators Council (“SSC”) Members Present:** Hüsniye Çoğür (Chair), Rose Asaf, Mike Avgerinos, Rawan Dareer (for Sara Pan Algarra), Neha Dembla, Jia Gu (for Kosar Kosar), Rachel Law, Saman Marji, Shannon Morgan, Anesu Nyatanga, Clare Russell, Quentin Turner, Christopher VanDemark, Varsha Yerasi, and Dina Yohanes.

**Deans Council Members Present:** Dominic Brewer (Chair), Charles Bertolami, H. Austin Booth, Thomas Carew, Susan Greenbaum, Phillip Harper, Cheryl Healton, Randy Hertz (for Trevor Morrison), Gene Jarrett, Elena Piercy (for Rangarajan Sundaram), Erin Potter (for Geeta Menon), David Schachter (for Sherry Glied), Eileen Sullivan-Marx, and Susanne Wofford.

**Administrative Management Council (“AMC”) Members Present:** Michael McCaw (Chair), Regina Drew, Carrie Meconis, Carolyn Ritter, Katie Santo, Pamela Stewart, and Juan Tie.

**University Administration Members Present:** Lisa Coleman, Martin Dorph, Andrew Hamilton, and Terrance Nolan.

President Hamilton welcomed members of the Senate to the meeting.

## **PRELIMINARY MATTERS**

### **Review and Approval of the Minutes of the November 8, 2018 Meeting**

Upon motion duly made and seconded, the minutes of the November 8, 2018 meeting were approved unanimously as presented.

## **STANDING COMMITTEE REPORTS**

### **Academic Affairs Committee Report**

Beverly Watkins, Academic Affairs Committee Co-Chair, reported that the Committee had two meetings on December 5<sup>th</sup>, one with the Academic Affairs Committee of the Board of Trustees and one standing meeting. At the standing meeting, the Committee reviewed and recommended Honorary Degree candidates and discussed working closely with the Senate Councils to determine an area of focus for next semester to support innovation in teaching at NYU.

Professor Watkins said that the Committee's meeting with Trustees was an example of how shared governance can work. She reported that the meeting focused on two topics: 1.) the wide range of neurodiversity among students, faculty, and staff and the need for accommodations and broader community understanding and sensitivity; and 2.) the issue of food insecurity among students and the need to provide additional resources.

## **COUNCIL REPORTS**

### **Administrative Management Council**

AMC Chair Michael McCaw reported that members of the AMC had a thoughtful and engaged meeting with members of the Board of Trustees at which they were able to highlight concerns and opportunities for administrators. He said that the AMC looks forward to continuing conversations with the Board.

At its General Assembly Meeting on November 13<sup>th</sup>, Lisa Coleman, Senior Vice President for Global Inclusion, Diversity, and Strategic Innovation and Chief Diversity Officer, shared findings from the Being@NYU assessment, focusing on results for the administrator community. The AMC also had a fireside chat with President Hamilton on November 6<sup>th</sup>, which Mr. McCaw said was helpful for learning more about University priorities. Mr. McCaw reported that the AMC was invited to present at a national IdeaScale conference on their use of the platform for "OpenAMC." Finally, Mr. McCaw encouraged members of the Senate to participate in the AMC Annual Toy Drive by donating items online or at the drop-off locations across campus.

### **Student Senators Council**

SSC Chair Hüsniye Çöğür reported that at its most recent Student Government Assembly (“SGA”) meeting the body passed a resolution on the human rights of Palestinians, requesting that the University adopt a socially responsible endowment investment policy that reflects this issue. The SGA also established a working group focused on food insecurity on campus. Ms. Çöğür reported that a working group examining how NYU addresses mass incarceration will also be formed following protests led by the student group, Incarceration to Education Coalition (“IEC”). Ms. Çöğür thanked IEC and Marc Wais, Senior Vice President for Student Affairs, for their work on this.

Ms. Çöğür reported that student leaders also had two opportunities to meet with members of the Board of Trustees on December 11<sup>th</sup> at a lunch meeting and a smaller meeting with the SGA Executive Committee. She said the groups engaged in discussion on a number of topics including additional mechanisms for increasing communication between the Board and students; increasing transparency around Board and University administration decisions related to issues raised by students; the need for facilitating better communication between the Board and students so that both groups are aware of the work each is doing; the University’s selection process for a food service vendor; the value of increasing engagement between NYU alumni and current students; the need for ensuring that students are aware of the University resources available and also feel comfortable seeking help; and the suggestion of hiring a Dean of Students to serve as a student advocate and a central place for students to go to be connected to resources across the University.

## **BRIEFINGS TO THE SENATE**

President Hamilton said that several guests were invited to give brief updates to the Senate on some key University initiatives.

### **Sustainability**

President Hamilton introduced Cecil Scheib, Assistant Vice President for Sustainability. Mr. Scheib said that the Office of Sustainability has been working hard in the pursuit of making NYU one of the greenest urban campuses in the United States. He stated that a big part of the effort is making NYU’s buildings more energy efficient, which is a huge financial undertaking since the University is primarily comprised of older buildings. Mr. Scheib said that studies have shown that “green buildings” that offer more ventilation and clean air can have a positive impact on cognitive function. In addition to being an opportunity for carbon reduction, NYU’s efforts to improve the energy efficiency of its buildings will also support academic excellence by making the buildings more comfortable for use.

Mr. Scheib said that NYU is also committed to LEED certification. NYU currently has 11

buildings that are LEED certified, and every significant construction project NYU undertakes in the future will be LEED certified, targeting Silver certification as a minimum. Including projects currently in progress, Mr. Scheib reported that NYU has over two million square feet of LEED certified space.

Next, Mr. Scheib reported on improvements to the environmental performance at Brittany Hall. He said that building upgrades, including improved thermal comfort, double-pane windows, student control of space temperatures, and more resilient mechanical systems, resulted in an 81% reduction in space heating energy use, a 43% reduction in carbon emissions, and a 49% reduction in operation costs. In addition, students have reported that the double-pane windows have helped with noise reduction, facilitating a better environment for studying.

Mr. Scheib reported that the renovations to 370 Jay Street, which will serve as a new academic building in downtown Brooklyn, are certified LEED platinum and expected to cut energy costs by half.

When he last reported to the Senate in March 2018, Mr. Scheib encouraged members of the NYU community to submit ideas through the Office of Sustainability's IdeaScale platform. He reported that more than 2,300 students, faculty, staff, and administrators contributed 178 ideas on a variety of sustainability topics such as making the University free of plastic, donating and composting leftover food, and more. To help implement some of the short-term measures, NYU formed a Sustainability Working Group. Mr. Scheib thanked the members of the Working Group for their time and expertise.

President Hamilton invited questions and comments from members of the Senate. In response to a question about how the installation of air conditioning in older buildings fits in to the University's sustainability efforts, Mr. Scheib said that air conditioning can undoubtedly facilitate a better study environment and noted that the reduction in total energy use in Brittany Hall was able to be achieved even with the addition of air conditioning. The need for temperature regulation in classroom spaces was also discussed. Mr. Scheib said that the University recognizes that this is an ongoing issue and has been incorporating better temperature control when making plans for space renovations. He noted that renovations must be accomplished in line with the University's capital plan, and so it will take time to get to every building. In response to a question about how leased buildings fit in to the University's sustainability efforts, Mr. Scheib said that NYU's carbon footprint is inclusive of all its buildings, whether they are leased or owned. As such, the University will work on improvements to leased spaces within the parameters of what is allowed by the building owners.

President Hamilton thanked Mr. Scheib for his presentation.

### **Graduate Student Education**

President Hamilton introduced Phillip Harper, Dean of the Graduate School of Arts and Science ("GSAS"), to give an update on a faculty committee formed to develop

guidelines around graduate student mentoring. Dean Harper said that the committee's objective is to generate a set of explicit expectations and responsibilities to optimize relationships between faculty mentors and graduate students. He said they are working to make the guidelines specific enough to constitute clear parameters without dictating exactly what the relationship should look like in all instances. Dean Harper noted that the work is drawing on and refining pre-existing guidelines already in place at the University, including guidelines developed in 2013 by the Steinhardt School of Culture, Education, and Human Development ("Steinhardt") and expectations posted on the Office of Postdoctoral Affairs' website. The aim is to develop guidelines specific to GSAS, as well as uniform guidelines that can be adopted across the University.

Dean Harper said that the committee has had four working sessions and two listening sessions with doctoral students. Scheduling issues made it difficult for master's degree students to participate in the listening sessions so the committee conducted a survey for their feedback on current mentoring practices and opportunities for improvement. Dean Harper reported on several key findings: 1.) there is a necessary and unavoidable power imbalance between faculty mentors and graduate students, but this becomes problematic when it is exploited or abused; 2.) mentoring practices vary widely and range in intensity from excessive (over-mentoring) to neglectful, with most falling somewhere between those extremes; 3.) students need clear guidance as to what to expect from the mentor relationship; and 4.) it is necessary to define accountability within the relationship. Dean Harper explained that the next step is to draft a set of guidelines based on these findings to share with the participants in the working groups and listening sessions for feedback. In the spring, a small committee of faculty members and graduate students will convene to finalize the guidelines, which will then be circulated amongst the departments and programs for comments. Dean Harper said that the aim is for GSAS to have its own guidelines finalized by spring and then work will begin to establish a degree of regularity across the entire graduate domain for maximum possible uniformity.

President Hamilton invited questions and comments from members of the Senate. In response to a question, Dean Harper emphasized that the committee is cognizant of variations between doctoral and master's students, as well as across schools and degree programs. He emphasized that schools across the University will be consulted in developing the uniform guidelines.

President Hamilton thanked Dean Harper for his presentation.

### **Report on NYU Consolidated Financial Statements for Year Ended August 31, 2018**

President Hamilton introduced Stephanie Pianka, Senior Vice President for Finance and Budget and Chief Financial Officer, to report on NYU's consolidated financial statements for the year ended August 31, 2018. Ms. Pianka reported that the consolidated financial statements for NYU for the year ended August 31, 2018 (FY18) received an unmodified audit opinion from the University's independent auditors,

PricewaterhouseCoopers, and the financial statements will be posted on the NYU website soon. She noted that NYU's consolidated financial statements consist of two reporting entities: the University and NYU Langone Health.

Ms. Pianka then presented NYU's consolidated operating revenues for FY18. She reported that operating revenues were \$11.6 billion with a 17% year-over-year revenue growth. Patient care revenues were up from 61% to 64% of revenue year-over-year and tuition and fees were down from 18% to 16% of revenue year-over-year. FY18 operating revenues for the University (not including NYU Langone Health) were nearly \$3.3 billion, with 55% coming from tuition fees net of financial aid, followed by 17% from grants and contracts.

Ms. Pianka next presented NYU's consolidated operating expenses for FY18, which were \$11.5 billion. She said the growth in expenses this year was primarily driven by planned inflators and the significant investments in preparing for the opening of a new inpatient care facility for NYU Langone Health, the Kimmel Pavilion, and for investments in the Faculty Group Practice at the School of Medicine. FY18 operating expenses for the University (not including NYU Langone Health) were just under \$3.3 billion, with the largest expense being salary and fringe benefits at 56%, followed by facilities-related costs at 11%.

Ms. Pianka reported that NYU's long-term investments, primarily comprised of the endowment, are just under \$4.9 billion. She said that NYU's endowment was the 25<sup>th</sup> largest university endowment as of August 31, 2017 (the latest available comparison date), but NYU's endowment per student was ranked 187<sup>th</sup>.

The University's consolidated debt and other obligations were \$7.1 billion in FY18, helping to pay for construction and acquisition of facilities and improvements with a long-term life. Ms. Pianka reported that the University's debt has recently been used to finance projects such as 181 Mercer Street, the Co-Generation Plant, 370 Jay Street, and laboratory renovations at Washington Square and in Brooklyn.

Ms. Pianka summarized the FY18 results, reporting an \$11.2 million surplus for NYU on a consolidated basis. The University, less the School of Medicine, had revenue growth of 5%, expense growth of 5%, an increase in liabilities by \$280 million, and an increase in net assets of \$216 million in FY18.

President Hamilton invited questions and comments from members of the Senate and thanked Ms. Pianka for her presentation.

### **Los Angeles Program**

President Hamilton introduced Linda Mills, Vice Chancellor and Senior Vice Provost for Global Programs and University Life. Dr. Mills reported that NYU is developing a presence in Los Angeles with a pilot program beginning in Fall 2019 that will provide a unique study away opportunity for students. The pilot academic program has been

created by faculty from Gallatin School of Individualized Study, NYU Abu Dhabi, Steinhardt School of Culture, Education, and Human Development, Stern School of Business, and Tisch School of the Arts. Dr. Mills presented several reasons for choosing Los Angeles for this pilot program: 1.) Tisch created a successful study away experience a few years back, and other students had expressed interest in studying in Los Angeles, given the importance of the entertainment, media, and technology industries to their careers; 2.) NYU has 14,000 alums in Los Angeles, many of whom are working in entertainment, media, and technology; and 3.) California is currently the second largest sending state of undergraduates to NYU, and many NYU students from California have inquired about studying away in their home state.

Dr. Mills said that the program will be open to all students and will focus on experiential education to help prepare students for careers in entertainment, media, and technology, together with a robust set of course offerings. Dr. Mills described the area in central Los Angeles where classrooms and student housing will be located, noting that part of the appeal is that the academic space, student housing, and internship opportunities are within walking distance of an entertainment hub, known as the “La Brea neighborhood.” She encouraged members of the Senate to visit [www.nyu.edu/la-program](http://www.nyu.edu/la-program) for additional information.

President Hamilton invited questions and comments from members of the Senate. In response to questions received, Dr. Mills explained that the selection process for students to participate in the program will be localized within each school, and the application deadline is February 15, 2019. Dr. Mills also said that her office would re-double their outreach to school advisors to be sure they are familiar with the program and able to provide helpful information to interested students.

President Hamilton thanked Dr. Mills for her presentation.

### **Faculty Recruitment**

President Hamilton introduced Charlton McIlwain, Vice Provost for Faculty Engagement and Development, to report on faculty recruitment efforts. Dr. McIlwain said that the Being@NYU assessment reminded the University about the need for recruiting more diverse faculty. He said that NYU could look at the world of sports recruitment to think about faculty recruitment differently. He then described three keys to successful sports recruiting that can inform faculty recruiting: 1.) identify and develop talent early; 2.) build expansive scouting networks; and 3.) build pathways for recruits, and know and communicate with recruits about their aspirations. In terms of faculty recruitment, Dr. McIlwain said that NYU is moving away from a passive recruitment process, where positions are posted and the University waits for applications, and instead focusing on a more proactive process of identifying and tracking prospects in the pipeline early. Dr. McIlwain said that the University is also building and expanding its recruitment networks, as well as developing opportunities to communicate more regularly with prospects to get to know them beyond their CV and personal statement.

Dr. McIlwain next highlighted three existing programs at NYU that support faculty recruitment. In its second year at Steinhardt, Faculty First Look helps underrepresented doctoral and other terminal degree students prepare for future faculty careers. Dr. McIlwain said that the program not only helps these talented students prepare for the job search, but also helps them prepare for faculty life and success in academia. He noted that NYU is looking at expanding this program to other schools. The second program Dr. McIlwain highlighted is the NYU Provost's Postdoctoral Fellowship Program, which supports promising scholars and educators by providing faculty mentoring, professional development, and academic networking opportunities with the ultimate goal of preparing the participants for future faculty positions. Lastly, Dr. McIlwain highlighted NYU's high school programs that have the potential for developing the pipeline even further back, while also giving students access to higher education.

President Hamilton invited questions and comments from members of the Senate. In response to a question, Dr. McIlwain said that NYU's recruitment efforts are focused on finding the best talent for all faculty positions, not just tenure-track positions.

President Hamilton thanked Dr. McIlwain for his presentation.

### **NYU and the Stonewall Uprising 50<sup>th</sup> Anniversary**

President Hamilton introduced Lynne Brown, Senior Vice President for University Relations and Public Affairs. Dr. Brown said that NYU is planning a University-wide series of events, exhibits, and performances throughout next semester to celebrate and commemorate the 50<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the Stonewall uprising that occurred a few blocks from NYU (on June 28, 1969) and helped launch the modern LGBTQ+ movement. A steering committee whose members are drawn from various sectors of NYU has been in the planning stages for several months and will be ready to "go live" in January with the launch of an NYU website devoted to this effort. The website will help coordinate and amplify all the activities that will be taking place and offer a consistent visual identity. Dr. Brown shared posters and postcards that employ the design and encouraged members of the Senate to promote the events in their schools and departments. She said that some of the events planned include a series of programs at NYU Skirball, an exhibition at the Grey Art Gallery entitled "Art after Stonewall, 1969-1989," and an exhibit in the Bobst Gallery on the first floor of Bobst Library. There will also be photographs from that era in the Kimmel vitrines, as well as the installation of visual graphics on the windows and entrances of many NYU buildings. NYU is also coordinating with the NYC-wide Stonewall Coalition and will cross-promote events and activities.

President Hamilton invited questions and comments from members of the Senate and thanked Dr. Brown for her presentation.

### **181 Mercer Street Progress**

President Hamilton introduced Kenny Lee, Senior Director of Facilities and Construction

Management, to give an update on the progress of 181 Mercer Street. Mr. Lee shared images of plans for the 181 Mercer Street building and of the current construction site. He said that they are close to finishing the foundation phase, which will be completed in January 2019. Major construction milestones included demolition in October 2016, support of excavation in May 2017, foundations in March 2018, superstructure steel in January 2019, interior fitout in July 2019, and installation of the curtainwall in December 2019. Mr. Lee said that the planned opening date for the building is fall of 2022.

President Hamilton invited questions and comments from members of the Senate. In response to a question about the project budget, Ms. Pianka reported that the total budget of \$1.3 billion has not changed and remains on track.

President Hamilton thanked Mr. Lee for his presentation.

## **REPORT OF THE PRESIDENT**

President Hamilton announced that Robert Cashion has joined NYU as the new Senior Vice President for University Development and Alumni Relations and introduced him to the Senate.

President Hamilton reported that the federal government has until December 21, 2018 to pass a series of funding bills to avert a partial government shutdown. He noted that if a temporary shutdown were to occur (not lasting more than a few weeks), there would be minimal impact on NYU students and faculty since Congress has already passed funding bills for the Department of Education, which funds student aid programs, and the Department of Health and Human Services, which funds National Institutes of Health (NIH) research grants. Funding for the National Science Foundation (NSF) and the National Endowment for the Humanities (NEH) has yet to be passed, but disbursements for existing grants should continue uninterrupted.

President Hamilton reminded members of the Senate that at this time the previous year the University was concerned about the federal tax bill and its potential impact on higher education. The University was later relieved that the most troublesome provisions of the House version of the proposed tax bill that targeted higher education were not included in the final version of the bill that became federal law. President Hamilton said that one provision that did make it into the final bill requires all nonprofits to pay a tax on unrelated business income, such as income from the NYU bookstore, and pre-tax parking and transportation benefits provided to employees. He said that this would present a tax burden of more than \$2.5 million to NYU. However, following aggressive advocacy from the higher education community including NYU, New York State has decided that it will remove the state tax burden around transportation and parking, which will save NYU approximately \$600,000 next year. President Hamilton said that NYU will continue to advocate for this tax burden to be reversed at the federal level, as well.

President Hamilton next reported on recent rankings and assessments that highlight the academic excellence of NYU's faculty. He said that NYU is proud to have 139 faculty members as members of the multidisciplinary American Academy of Arts and Sciences (AAAS), making NYU 9<sup>th</sup> in the nation in terms of number of AAAS members, above Cornell, Penn, Northwestern, Brown, and many other peer institutions. President Hamilton said that the latest HERD ranking of the National Science Foundation, which is based on the amount of competitive research funding that a university receives, ranks NYU at 18<sup>th</sup> in the country, which is up five spots from the previous year and puts NYU ahead of Columbia, among others. President Hamilton said that NYU is also achieving academic excellence in the humanities, ranking 5<sup>th</sup> in competitive funding secured from the NEH.

President Hamilton then highlighted the success of NYU students and alumni. *Times Higher Education* recently ranked NYU 15<sup>th</sup> in the world in terms of employability of graduates. NYU's School of Law was ranked #1 by the *Princeton Review* in terms of career prospects for graduates. Two NYU Abu Dhabi students were selected as 2019 UAE Rhodes Scholars, and four students from across NYU have been selected as 2020 Schwarzman Scholars to study at Tsinghua University in Beijing. Six NYU alumni and students were named on *Forbes'* "30 Under 30" 2019 list. Finally, President Hamilton reported that the number of early decision applications to NYU this year rose by 38%.

President Hamilton invited questions and comments from members of the Senate. A question was raised about the recent announcement that Amazon plans to build a headquarters in Long Island City, Queens. President Hamilton said that New York City and State officials included NYU and other academic institutions in NYC in its bid, making the case that strong universities like NYU can provide the talent and expertise Amazon is looking for and be part of efforts to advance workforce development, executive education, and broadening the employee pipeline.

## **OTHER BUSINESS**

Student Senator Christopher VanDemark expressed support for an NYU graduate student group that is opposing planned changes to the NYU graduate student health insurance plan. He indicated his intention to draft a letter of support for the graduate student group to be presented at the next student government meeting. Executive Vice President Martin Dorph noted that this is an ongoing process and the planned changes to the NYU graduate student health insurance plan were a result of the annual review process of insurance plans for students and employees.

President Hamilton wished everyone a happy and restful holiday break. There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 10:45 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,  
Jessica Graham  
Director, Office of the Secretary