Minutes of a Stated Meeting of the
Senate of New York University
December 8, 2016

A stated meeting of the Senate of New York University was held on Thursday, December 8, 2016, at 9 a.m., in the Colloquium Room of the Global Center for Academic and Spiritual Life, 238 Thompson Street. The meeting was convened with President Hamilton in the chair.

Tenured/Tenure Track Faculty Senators Council (“T-FSC”) Members Present: Allen Mincer (Chair), Mark Alter (for Sharon Weinberg), Awam Amkpa, Juan Bello (for Arvind Rajagopal), Sylvain Cappell, Stephen Duncombe, Nick Economides, André Fenton, Stephen Figlewski, James Jacobs, Dale Jamieson, Robert Lapiner, Wen Ling, Béatrice Longuenesse, Darcey Merritt, Niyati Parekh, Carol Reiss (for Kwame Anthony Appiah), Robert Shapley, Paul Smoke, Arun Sundararajan, Tamar Schlick (for Daniel Tranchina), Nadrian Seeman (for Jim Uleman), Ivan Selesnick (for Phyllis Frankl), Nancy Van Deaverter, Amanda Watson, and Bradley Weslake (by telephone).

Full-Time Continuing Contract Faculty Senators Council (“C-FSC”) Members Present: Fred Carl (Chair), Joseph Borowiec, John Burt, Eugene Cittadino (for Mitchell Joachim), Michael Ferguson, Neal Herman, Sam Howard-Spink, Leila Jahangiri, Mary Killilea, Jung Kim, Brian Mooney, Joshua Paiz, Ezra Sacks, Larry Slater, Ben Stewart, Beverly Watkins, and Ethan Youngerman.

Student Senators Council (“SSC”) Members Present: Ryan Thomas (Chair), Michael Avgerinos, Tamara Cesaretti, Ghanaia Chaudhry, Husniye Cogur, Riyanna Dasgupta, Joseph Ehrenkranz, Amanda Ezachi, Armando Figueroa, Beamlek Hailemariam, Reed Hodkin (by telephone), Josy Jablons, Farzan Khan, Stephen Kho, Emeka Mba-Kalu, Joey Onwughalu, Angel Parker, Annie Seaman, Louis Slade, and Jim Wiltsee.

Deans Council Members Present: Thomas Carew (Chair), Dominic Brewer, Deborah Chyun (for Eileen Sullivan-Marx), Allyson Green, Anna Harvey, Cheryl Healan, Fiona Jaramillo (for Dennis Di Lorenzo), Karen Kraulik (for Gabrielle Starr), Beth Murray (for Peter Henry), Celeste Orangers (for Susanne Wofford), David Schacter (for Sherry Glied), Michael Stoller (for Carol Mandel), Louis Terracio (for Charles Bertolami), and Diann Witt (for Rohit Deo).

Administrative Management Council (“AMC”) Members Present: Raymond Lutzky (Chair), John DeSantis, Regina Drew, Pamela Kavalam, and Juan Tie.

University Administration Members Present: Robert Berne, Martin Dorph, Katherine Fleming, Andrew Hamilton, and Terrance Nolan.

Senate Committee Chairs (not mentioned above) Present: Arthur Tannenbaum.

Additional Presenters (not mentioned above) Present: Chris Bledsoe, Linda Chiarelli, Joe Juliano, Richard Maimon (architect, KieranTimberlake), Larry Maslon, and Will Paxson (architect, Davis Brody Bond).
President Andrew Hamilton welcomed members of the Senate to the meeting.

**Review and Approval of the Minutes of the November 10, 2016 Meeting**

Secretary of the Senate Terrance Nolan presented the minutes, noting that the following sentence was added to the minutes under the “Report of the President” in response to a request from a member of the Senate: “A question was raised about the current emphasis on affordability and ensuring that NYU has adequate resources to finance the ambitious initiative given the constraints around significant tuition increases or increasing the size of the student body, the issue of which President Hamilton responded that administration is aware.”

Upon motion duly made and seconded, the Minutes of the November 10, 2016 meeting were approved unanimously as modified.

**STANDING COMMITTEE REPORTS**

**Executive Committee Report**

Professor Fred Carl said that at its meeting on November 17th, the Executive Committee approved revisions to the Standing Committee assignments. The revised list was included in the Senate materials distributed in advance of the meeting.

**Academic Affairs Committee Report**

Committee Chair Ben Stewart said that the Academic Affairs Committee discussed names of proposed Honorary Degree candidates and met with the Registrar to begin to discuss compiling the University calendar for 2018 to 2021. He noted that the Registrar will be reaching out to each Council of the Senate and others for feedback. The Committee will have recommendations for the Senate to consider at its February 2017 meeting regarding the future of the Founder's Day Award.

**Financial Affairs Committee Report**

Anthony Jiga, Vice President for Budget and Planning, said that the Financial Affairs Committee’s meeting on November 28th focused on two topics: 1) the possible financial impacts resulting from possible law and policy changes under the new administration and Congress and 2) comparing NYU’s undergraduate student charges, financial aid, and faculty salaries with that of peer institutions.

**Committee on Organization and Governance Report**

The Committee on Organization and Governance Chair Larry Slater said that the Committee will be reviewing the functions of the Senate and of the individual Councils as defined by the University Bylaws to determine whether any changes should be made. The Committee hopes to bring any recommendations to the Senate by the March meeting.
Public Affairs Committee Report

Arthur Tannenbaum, Public Affairs Committee Chair, said that the Committee is preparing to report in the spring on government relations and quality of life around campus.

COUNCIL REPORTS

Administrative Management Council (AMC)

AMC Chair Raymond Lutzky reported that the AMC discussed the new web portal NYU Global Home (an upgrade to NYUHome that is being rolled out over the course of the coming year), voted on a proposed amendment to the AMC bylaws, and confirmed Mike McCaw as Vice Chair at its meeting on December 6th. He said that the AMC is pleased to be hosting a Town Hall with President Hamilton for administrators and staff on Friday, December 9th. Dr. Lutzky thanked everyone who participated in the AMC’s annual Thanksgiving Food Drive, which collected more than 3,000 items for Xavier Mission (Manhattan) and City Harvest (Brooklyn). He then reminded the Senate about the NYU AMC Annual Toy Drive that is collecting new, unwrapped, nonviolent toys and books through December 15th for children of the 9th Police Precinct in the East Village, the 84th Police Precinct in Brooklyn, and Herbert G. Birch Manhattan Early Childhood Center. A list of drop-off locations and information about online donations are available on the AMC homepage.

Deans Council

Deans Council Chair Thomas Carew gave the Deans Council report. At its meeting on December 7th, the Deans Council had a wide-ranging and productive discussion with Len Peters, NYU’s new Vice President and Chief Information Officer, about ways in which the different schools might effectively engage with the CIO office. The Council also met with Senior Presidential Fellow Ellen Schall, Vice President of Finance Operations and Treasurer Stephanie Pianka, and Mr. Jiga about affordability and procurement initiatives designed to advance the goal of making NYU more affordable for more students. Finally, the Council had the opportunity to meet with a representative from the search firm assisting in the search for the position of Senior Vice President for University Development and Alumni Relations, which will be vacated by Debra LaMorte at the end of this academic year. Dean Carew expressed the Deans Council’s deep gratitude to Ms. LaMorte for her unconditional commitment and extraordinary service to NYU.

Tenured/Tenure Track Faculty Senators Council (T-FSC)

T-FSC Chair Allen Mincer said that the T-FSC has not met since the November Senate meeting but that its committees are hard at work.

Full-Time Continuing Contract Faculty Senators Council (C-FSC)

C-FSC Chair Fred Carl provided the report of the Council. He said that the C-FSC welcomed Provost Katherine Fleming at its final meeting of the semester on December 6th. Beth Kienle,
University Registrar, also gave a short presentation to the Council on the University academic calendar. The next C-FSC meeting will take place on February 2, 2017.

**Student Senators Council (SSC)**

SSC Chair Ryan Thomas reported that the SSC’s last meeting of the semester would be held later that day. He said that the SSC had been visited by a number of representatives from offices around campus to discuss current policy changes. The SSC has also been reviewing and discussing its Bylaws to make necessary updates.

**UPDATE ON 181 MERCER**

President Hamilton stated that remarkable progress has been made on the 181 Mercer Street project, adding that the building development, planning, and programming details have been developed in collaboration with the schools that will be the primary occupants of the building. He noted that this presentation to the Senate was preceded by presentations to the Senior Leadership Team and Board of Trustees and would be followed by a series of Open Houses for members of the NYU community and public to learn more about the project. Further, in early January the University will launch the “181 Mercer Street Open House Space” that will feature information and models about the project.

President Hamilton invited Linda Chiarelli, Vice President of Capital Projects and Facilities, and Joe Juliano, Vice Provost for Strategic Planning, to give an overview of the programming that will be in the 181 Mercer building. Ms. Chiarelli stated that the schematic design of the building is complete and that the University has moved into the design development phase of the project. The demolition of the Coles Sports and Recreation building began in October and is expected to be completed by the end of January 2017, with construction of the new building expected to take place through 2021.

Ms. Chiarelli invited Mr. Juliano to speak about the academic space in the building. Mr. Juliano said that the 58 to 60 classrooms planned for the 181 Mercer building will respond to two key factors: 1) unmanageably high room utilization currently; and 2) matching classes with properly sized and equipped rooms. The architects have been working closely with a committee of faculty to respond to their teaching needs, and the design of the classrooms will allow for flexibility in cases of curriculum changes in the future. Mr. Juliano then spoke about the performing arts features of the building that will serve students in the Tisch School of the Arts and the Steinhardt School of Culture, Education, and Human Development.

Ms. Chiarelli gave the Senate an overview of the diverse program space in the building, including classrooms, performing arts spaces, community and dining facilities, athletics and recreation, student residential space, and faculty apartments. Davis Brody Bond and KieranTimberlake are the architectural team behind the project and she invited architect Richard Maimon of KieranTimberlake to share the current building designs. Mr. Maimon first outlined the project goals, including designing a building that represents NYU, meets the University’s diverse program needs, provides opportunities for community interaction, advances NYU’s commitment to sustainability, and is functional for current needs while
flexible for future needs. Mr. Maimon next reviewed the building organization, noting that the circulation of the building is at the exterior while the programming is at the center, which not only reduces the carbon footprint and allows for natural light to be shared, but also helps make the building a dynamic place of interaction, collaboration, and activity. Mr. Maimon shared detailed floor plans that demonstrated the many functions of the building. He also noted the steps being taken to address sustainability by taking advantage of the University’s co-generation plant and augmenting that with a variety of innovative techniques. The key goals in the design of the building include transparency (provide views into and out of the building and harvesting daylight), place (dynamism and interaction of many inhabitants, space for collaboration, and creation of a place to build community that relates to the neighborhood), diversity (a single building made up of many parts working together, reflective of a vibrant community of personalities and interests coming together), and performance (reduce energy consumption and passively optimize building microclimate and interior comfort).

Martin Dorph, Executive Vice President for Finance and Information Technology, was next invited to speak about the financial impact of the 181 Mercer Street project and how it fits into the University’s overall capital budgets. Mr. Dorph noted that a more detailed version of his presentation will be available on the project website and that he would also be available to meet with schools and individual Councils to provide a more in-depth presentation. Mr. Dorph began with the history of the project to illustrate how it has changed since it was first presented nearly five years ago. He said that as currently designed and programmed, the project will be approximately 735,000 square feet with a projected cost of $1,285 million (up from 670,000 square feet with a cost of $727 million when the project was first considered). The changes in cost are attributable to the following factors: 1) a larger program for the building requiring additional square footage as recommended by the University Space Priorities Working Group (USPWG) and as permitted under the City approvals; 2) based on USPWG recommendations, proportional increase in spaces with higher costs per square foot (e.g. theaters); 3) cost premiums associated with structural support to clear wide span and double height spaces such as theaters, gymnasium, etc.; 4) increase in construction market costs; and 5) additional cost escalation due to the passage of time. Mr. Dorph said that the financial plan for the 181 Mercer Street project assumes debt issuance of $947 million, fundraising of $300 million ($145 million raised to date), and use of the University "working capital" (cash on hand) of $38 million, spread over the next five years.

Mr. Dorph next spoke about the impact of the 181 Mercer Street project on the University’s finances as a whole. While the project has changed in the past five years, the University’s overall capital plan through 2024 is consistent with the amount projected in 2012 and with the University’s overall rate of capital spending over the past decade. Mr. Dorph said that the latest projections show that even with the overall higher cost of the project, the University will generally meet or outperform the financial metrics established in 2012 with one important exception – the University will take on more debt than originally planned but the ability to pay for that debt will not be adversely affected.

President Hamilton invited comments from the key stakeholders who have been most involved in the project. Dean Allyson Green spoke about her positive experience working with the architects to make sure the building meets the needs of the Tisch School and noted that they are excited by the prospect of being able to collaborate with the Steinhardt School in ways
they were never able to before. Dean Dominic Brewer echoed Dean Green’s sentiment and added that the building will finally give students in the Tisch and Steinhardt schools the practice, rehearsal, and performance spaces they deserve. Dean Carew added that the 181 Mercer Street project will have a ripple effect in that the new spaces will help decompress other overburdened buildings, thus opening up the possibility for creating more laboratories in the Silver School. Chris Bledsoe, Assistant Vice President for Student Affairs and Athletics Director, emphasized the benefit of having a multi-functional building that brings members of the NYU community together in one space. Larry Maslon, Chair of the Superblock Stewardship Advisory Committee, said that the Committee was established to give input on quality-of-life issues on the Superblocks before, during, and after construction, and that the Committee is pleased with how the University has responded to concerns that they have brought forward. The Committee has met every two weeks for more than two years, participating in the architect selection, weighing in on programming, and ensuring transparency in the University’s decision-making.

President Hamilton then invited questions and comments from members of the Senate. The Senate engaged in further discussion about the flexibility of the new classrooms to respond to varying needs, faculty housing, and the project budget. In response to a question about contingencies should the project go over budget, Mr. Dorph said that the budget accounts for expected inflation in construction costs and although there are contingencies, they are confident that the budget is realistic.

EQUITY, DIVERSITY, AND INCLUSION ADVISORY TASK FORCE REPORT

President Hamilton invited Charlton McIlwain, Co-Chair of the Equity, Diversity, and Inclusion Advisory Task Force, to give an update on the Task Force’s work. Professor McIlwain said that he would highlight a couple of points in a joint letter from President Hamilton and the Task Force that was recently sent to the NYU community and also provided to the Senate at the meeting (attached to these minutes as Exhibit A). First, a search committee composed of faculty, students, and administrators has begun its work in searching for a Chief Diversity Officer. Professor McIlwain said that the number of interested and qualified applicants so far is more than they had anticipated at this stage. Second, the University has engaged Rankin & Associates, which has worked with nearly 200 campuses and institutions, to assist with NYU’s first-ever climate study. Professor McIlwain said that the 18-month project will commence in earnest in January and will involve wide consultation with groups across campus.

Professor McIlwain then invited questions and comments from members of the Senate. In response to a question about diversity in hiring of faculty, Professor McIlwain stated that the Faculty Working Group of the Task Force has been researching practices at other institutions and discussing what goals the University should set in terms of faculty hiring and what outcomes we would hope to see. He added that they are also looking to establish recommendations for changing the culture of the faculty hiring process. The Senate engaged in further discussion about how some schools have taken steps to have an impact in the short-term, including changes to recruitment practices and attention to representation on the search committees. It was noted that in addition to recruitment, there also needs to be a focus on retention by ensuring that the University has a welcoming and inclusive environment.
REPORT OF THE PRESIDENT

President Hamilton said that since the last Senate meeting, which took place just after the U.S. presidential election, there have been several communications from the President’s office and from Deans to address concerns expressed by members of the community, particularly around the status of undocumented students at NYU. He said that they have tried to be as clear and specific as possible in the communications, and they will continue to pay close attention to developments in Washington.

President Hamilton then notified the Senate that when he arrived in London for a site visit he was greeted with the sad news that Gary Slapper, NYU London Site Director, had passed away suddenly the day before. He said that Gary was a cherished member of the NYU community who will be greatly missed. President Hamilton wished all members of the Senate a happy, restful, and peaceful holiday season.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 11:00 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,
Jessica Graham
Director, Office of the Secretary
Dear NYU Community,

Around this time last year, many members of our community gathered for a listening session during which dozens of our students shared their disappointment with how they were being treated at NYU. It was a heartbreaking moment for everyone involved, and one that compelled us to take stock of our current environment and renew our commitment to improving our community. The University Senate Executive Committee created the Equity, Diversity, and Inclusion Task Force, which includes students, faculty, and administrators, as an immediate outcome of that session and charged the Task Force with recommending specific actions the University should take to ensure that all members of our community feel like they belong at NYU.

The very first official meeting of this presidency was with the Task Force; in the months since, this issue has never lessened as a priority. We believe that the work of the Task Force is critical to ongoing progress toward our shared goal of producing the structural, institutional, and systemic changes necessary to strengthen the state of equity, diversity, and inclusion at NYU for long into the future.

The Task Force will present an interim report to the University Senate on December 8. In advance of that, we are pleased to report on the Task Force’s progress to date and, more importantly, on the concrete actions the University has taken so far in response to the Task Force’s recommendations.

Chief Diversity Officer
In response to one of the earliest Task Force recommendations, NYU has commenced a search for a Chief Diversity Officer. This senior-level administrator will report directly to the President, work in close partnership with the Provost, collaborate across schools and units, and participate on the President’s Senior Leadership Team. The CDO will lead the development and implementation of a strategic vision and operational plan that systemically advances diversity, equity, and inclusion as core components of the university’s mission. The CDO will be supported by human, financial, and technological resources necessary to achieve University goals.

The search committee includes faculty, students, and administrators whose expertise, experience, and demonstrated commitment to both NYU and to issues of equity, diversity, and inclusion make them ideal partners in the search to fill this critical role. Three members of the Task Force serve on the search committee. The bulk of the committee’s work will take place this semester, with concluding work in January and February. The committee will nominate a maximum of three finalists to the President. We hope to be able to announce the incumbent as early in the Spring 2017 semester as possible. In the meantime, the committee welcomes
nominations and suggestions from all members of the NYU community via email to drcramer@imsearch.com or to any of the search committee members.

**Assessment**

The Task Force also recommended that NYU embark on its first-ever climate study, which will help us to gain a better understanding of how our students and employees experience the living, learning, and working environment at NYU, as well as to identify specific actions to address any shortcomings. We have hired a well-regarded consultant, Rankin & Associates, which has worked with nearly 200 campuses and institutions, to assist us with this work. The comprehensive climate study will focus on our primary constituencies - our students, faculty, administrators, and staff. The process of developing the survey will be consultative and transparent; the survey outcomes will be shared broadly and become a foundation upon which NYU will benchmark progress toward making the University a model institution for advancing equity, diversity, and inclusion.

The Climate Study Working Group (CSWG) Core Team comprises a subcommittee of the Task Force and also includes representatives from the President’s Office and other NYU units. The core team had its first meeting on November 8. The 18-month project will commence in earnest in January. Focus groups should occur during the Spring 2017 semester to inform the development of the assessment tool, which will be administered during the Fall 2017 semester. The CSWG will operate under a policy of transparency and will share updates to the entire NYU community at regular intervals throughout the project.

**Data Collection, Tracking, and Reporting**

The Task Force has encouraged the university to revise methods for collection and sharing data to support the mission of enhancing equity, inclusion, and diversity at NYU. In the April report to the University Senate, the Task Force recommended that the university take affirmative steps to develop systems that ensure the integrity of all identifying information it collects about students, faculty, administrators, and staff. The Task Force further recommended that systems be put in place to make diversity-related data as available as possible, including designating an office responsible for regularly collating, analyzing, and reporting the findings from these data.

The university now has a coordinated process in place to monitor and report on student enrollment data and will share employee data as soon as possible. NYU employees can help to ensure that the University has the most accurate data by visiting the “Personal Information” section of the Workday tab in NYU Home and updating the information therein.

**Faculty Hiring**

The Task Force has also encouraged the University to strengthen its commitment to increasing faculty diversity, with a focus on faculty from underrepresented groups. Every school has its own practices for hiring. The President and the Provost are in discussions with each school about how to adapt those practices to ensure increased diversity. Moreover, the Provost’s Office and the Office of Equal Opportunity offer trainings, toolkits, and other resources to assist search committees in their efforts to yield robust, diverse candidate pools.

**Bias Response Line**

During last year’s listening session, many students noted that they did not know where to turn
when they experienced bias, discrimination, or harassing behavior within the NYU community. The Task Force leadership heard similar criticisms during various listening sessions with employees. As a direct result, NYU has launched a Bias Response Line (BRL) as a mechanism through which members of our community can register these types of experiences. Experienced administrators in the Office of Equal Opportunity (OEO) receive and assess reports, and then help facilitate responses, which may include referral to another University school or unit, or, if warranted, investigation according to the University's existing Non-Discrimination and Anti-Harassment Policy.

The Task Force has offered suggestions on the pilot phase of the BRL roll out. The BRL team will report its initial findings to the Task Force in December and then share its learnings with the wider community, with the goal of fostering a more equitable and inclusive environment at NYU. Please share any suggestions you may have with a Task Force member or with the BRL team via email to bias.response@nyu.edu.

Affirmative Statement
Our community also called for the development of an affirmative statement of the University’s commitment to equity, diversity, and inclusion that will serve as a compass as we seek to improve our operations in the future. Several students, faculty, and administrators provided input during the drafting phase of the statement, which the Task Force has refined and its co-chairs have endorsed.

Increased Resources
The University has increased its investment in longstanding programs that have effectively supported equity, diversity, and inclusion efforts, including the Academic Achievement Program, the Opportunities Programs, and the Center for Multicultural Education and Programs (CMEP). CMEP recently hired a new Director and Associate Director, and opened its new and expanded space on the 8th floor of Kimmel.

NYU has also increased its investment in successful Provostial programs to widen the pipeline for scholars from underrepresented racial and ethnic groups, and to support recruiting, retaining, and promoting NYU faculty from under-represented racial and ethnic groups. The Task Force will also help the University think about how to enhance services for persons with disabilities.

The Work Ahead
During the recent NYU Together event that was part of Inauguration Week activities, the Task Force outlined its current work, which is now focusing on five primary objectives:

1) identifying outcomes NYU should be striving to meet when it comes to equity, inclusion, and diversity;
2) determining what goals we should set to attain those outcomes;
3) determining what programs and policies must be instituted to achieve these goals;
4) identifying what resources it will take; and
5) producing a final report for the community.
Much more is underway. We look forward to improving efforts to communicate information about all of the good work being done across NYU—by individuals, departments, schools, and units. Task Force members will continue to engage all of the community to help NYU be a truly cosmopolitan intellectual home for all and to strive ever more powerfully for equity.

The changes we seek require leadership and institutional partnerships. We are fortunate to have both. I, Provost Fleming, and the University’s Senior Leadership Team have asserted our unwavering commitment to these shared efforts. The President’s Office has dedicated both human and financial resources to assist the Task Force.

We all recognize that the work of advancing equity, diversity, and inclusion is ongoing. Human diversity is always evolving, and it is impossible to tap, fully, the true talent that lies in humankind. But we will not stop until we at NYU, as a global university, do everything we can to get closer to that goal. We invite you to participate in this work by sharing your ideas through the newly launched Task Force IdeaScale website.

Sincerely,

Andrew Hamilton
President

Charlton McIlwain and Gabrielle Starr
Task Force Co-Chairs